

7-2015

## Document - Level Finding Aid

Brooklyn Law School Library

Follow this and additional works at: <https://brooklynworks.brooklaw.edu/trager>

---

### Recommended Citation

Brooklyn Law School Library, "Document - Level Finding Aid" (2015). *David G. Trager Papers from the NYC Charter Revision Commissions: Dec. 1986-Nov. 1988 & Dec. 1988-Nov. 1989*. 34.  
<https://brooklynworks.brooklaw.edu/trager/34>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Special Collections at BrooklynWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in David G. Trager Papers from the NYC Charter Revision Commissions: Dec. 1986-Nov. 1988 & Dec. 1988-Nov. 1989 by an authorized administrator of BrooklynWorks.

**Brooklyn Law School Archives**  
**Papers of Hon. David G. Trager on New York City Charter Revision, 1985-1990**

**DOCUMENT-LEVEL FINDING AID**

**SCOPE AND CONTENT NOTE:**

The documents described herein were collected by the late Judge David G. Trager during his service as a member of two successive New York City Charter Revision Commissions, the first constituted during the period December 1986 to November 1988, and the second during the period December 1988 to November 1989<sup>1</sup>.

Documents #1-79B, currently stored in drawers 1-2 were originally housed in 24 looseleaf binders, arranged in rough chronological sequence. They consist of background materials prepared for the NYCCRC, including correspondence, notices, proposals, speeches, testimony, and transcripts. Documents #1-15 relate to hearings in held in 1987 by the first Commission; documents #16-68 relate to hearings held in 1988 by the first Commission; and documents #69-79B relate to hearings held in 1989 by the second Commission.

Documents #80-359, currently stored in drawers 2-3 consist of a variety of materials including memoranda, correspondence, drafts, proposals and responses to proposals, publications, and reports related to the work of both Commissions. While documents that were originally together have been kept together, they are arranged in neither chronological nor subject order.

Documents #360-368, currently stored in drawer 3 consist of bound volumes of transcripts of some of the public hearings held by both Commissions, as well as the second Commission's final report.

Documents #369-752, currently stored in drawers 3-4, consist of bound and unbound reports, memoranda, correspondence, drafts, proposals and responses to proposals, and publications, nearly all from the period 1987-1989.

For the convenience of researchers and without disturbing the original order, the processing archivist has arranged the entire record group into the following eight subject categories:

A: General (documents #1-469)

B: Voting Rights (documents #470-542): including minority representation, weighted voting for members of the Board of Estimate, filling vacancies, special elections, approval voting, and voter assistance

C: Mayoral Inability (documents #543-551)

D: The City Council (documents #552-581)

---

<sup>1</sup> See Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. & Eric Lane, *The Policy and Politics of Charter Making: The Story of New York City's 1989 Charter*, 42 N.Y.L. Sch. L. Rev. 723.

E: Local Voice in Government (documents #582-592): including community boards, community governance in general, and decentralization of government services

F: Land Use (documents #593-680): including landmark preservation, historic districts, and disposition of public properties

G: Ethics (documents #681-706): including conflicts of interest and campaign finance reform

H: Internal Controls (documents #707-752): including contracting process, procurement, budget process, City Administrative Procedure Act, and Civilian Complaint Review Board

#### **HISTORICAL NOTE:**

The New York City Charter establishes the basic form of organization and administration for New York City's government, setting forth both its structure and the manner in which it operates.

In 1777, with the adoption of the state Constitution, the State of New York recognized the British colonial charter, known as the *Montgomerie Charter of 1731*, for what is now known as New York City.<sup>2</sup> The City Charter could not be amended by its citizens; rather amendments required an act by the New York State Legislature. From 1777 to 1890, the City Charter went through fifteen revisions.<sup>3</sup> Cities within New York State did not easily gain the right to amend their own charters. This fight became known as the struggle for municipal home rule. The first major victory for cities came with the New York State Constitutional Convention of 1894. The New York State Legislature divided cities into three classes by population. This enabled the legislature to pass general laws to address the problems of cities of equal size.<sup>4</sup>

While the New York State Legislature relaxed its control of small- and medium-sized cities, it enacted a series of charters that tried to control the power of New York City. Of particular note is the Charter of Greater New York (1898), under which Manhattan, the Bronx, Brooklyn, Queens, and Staten Island were merged into the City of New York (informally, New York City). Thus did these former cities and communities become the five boroughs of what is now New York City.<sup>5</sup> From 1898 to 1923, the New York State Legislature placed a number of checks on New York City's powers.

- Under the 1898 Charter, the mayor's powers were reduced, the offices of the borough presidents were created, and the power of the Board of Estimate and Apportionment was

---

<sup>2</sup> George William Edwards, *New York as an Eighteenth Century Municipality, 1731-1776*, 178 STUDIES IN HIST., ECON., & PUB. L. 17 (1917).

<sup>3</sup> Kenneth T. Jackson, THE ENCYCLOPEDIA OF NEW YORK CITY 203-207 (1st ed. 1995).

<sup>4</sup> Div. of Local Gov't Servs., New York State Dep't of State, REVISING CITY CHARTERS IN NEW YORK STATE 2 (James A. Coon Local Gov't Technical Series, 1998).

<sup>5</sup> See Jackson, *supra* note 3 at 205-206.

expanded. The Board was composed of eight ex officio members: the Mayor, the Comptroller, and the President of the Board of Aldermen (which would eventually evolve into the City Council), each of whom was elected citywide and had two votes; and the five borough presidents, each having one vote.<sup>6</sup>

- The 1901 Charter decentralized New York City government by strengthening the borough presidents and the Board of Estimate and Apportionment.<sup>7</sup> The Board was given authority to set the City's budget and exercise residual powers.<sup>8</sup>
- By 1914, the Legislature gave all the cities in the state except New York City a role in defining their charters.<sup>9</sup>

New York City was finally granted the power to amend its charter without special action by the Legislature in 1924.<sup>10</sup> By 1963, when the New York State Municipal Home Rule Law was enacted, the 1924 law was incorporated without substantial change.<sup>11</sup>

In the 1980's, a number of federal lawsuits over equal representation had consequences for the system of governance used by New York City.<sup>12</sup> Of particular note is the action commenced in 1982 by three registered voters of the Borough of Brooklyn who sought declaratory and injunctive relief to remedy claimed disproportionate representation of their borough on the Board of Estimate.<sup>13</sup> In 1986, U.S. District Judge Edward R. Neaher of the Eastern District ruled that the voting structure of the Board of Estimate was unconstitutional.<sup>14</sup>

In response to the Eastern District's ruling, New York City Mayor Edward I. Koch (1924-2013; mayoralty 1978-1989) appointed a charter revision commission led by Richard Ravitch (born 1933) in December 1986. The first or "Ravitch Commission" was an independent 15-member body with broad authority to study and recommend changes to the structure of the City's government. On October 8, 1987, the

---

<sup>6</sup> *Id.*

<sup>7</sup> *Id.* at 207-208.

<sup>8</sup> *Id.* at 122-123.

<sup>9</sup> *Id.* at 208.

<sup>10</sup> See Div. of Local Gov't Servs., New York State Dep't of State, *supra* note 3.

<sup>11</sup> *Id.*

<sup>12</sup> See Jackson, *supra* note 3 at 208.

<sup>13</sup> Morris v. Bd. of Estimate, 551 F. Supp. 652 (E.D.N.Y. 1982).

<sup>14</sup> Morris v. Bd. of Estimate, 647 F. Supp. 1463 (E.D.N.Y. 1986).

*Morris* decision was affirmed by the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, which ordered the implementation of a remedy within a one year.<sup>15</sup> In April 1988, the United States Supreme Court granted certiorari of *Morris* as the Ravitch Commission was beginning its final deliberations. As a result, it deferred any proposal relating to the methods of election and powers of elected officials until the Supreme Court issued its decision. But the Ravitch Commission proceeded with its other work, presenting its recommendations to the citizens of New York City in the general election held in November 1988. The proposals were overwhelmingly approved and the authority granted to the Ravitch Commission expired.

On January 19, 1989, Mayor Koch appointed Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. (born 1935) as the new chairman of a reconstituted NYCCRC (second or “Schwarz Commission”), as well as re-appointing all former members who were willing to continue their service and appointing four new members. On March 22, 1989, the Supreme Court unanimously affirmed *Morris*.<sup>16</sup> The voters of New York City approved the Schwarz Commission’s final proposals in the general election held on November 7, 1989, as well as electing a new mayor, David N. Dinkins (born 1927; BLS Class of 1956; mayoralty 1990-1993). As had the 1988 referendum on Charter revision, the 1989 referendum marked the end of the NYCCRC’s mandate.

City charter revisions seldom galvanize masses of voters. Usually, they are approved by a majority of 4 to 1. In 1989, the Schwarz Commission’s proposals were only approved by majority of 5 to 4.<sup>17</sup> But the approved final proposals of the Schwarz Commission had to survive one final test: Under the Voting Rights Act, the United States Justice Department needed to decide whether the proposed changes in government structure would diminish the voting strength of New York City’s minority residents.<sup>18</sup> On December 13, 1989, the Department of Justice approved the new municipal government structure, which therefore took effect on January 1, 1990.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> *Morris v. Bd. of Estimate*, 831 F.2d 384 (2d Cir. 1987).

<sup>16</sup> *Bd. of Estimate of City of New York v. Morris*, 489 U.S. 688 (1989).

<sup>17</sup> Alan Finder, *Opposition to Charter Change Diverse*, N.Y. TIMES, Nov. 10, 1989,

<http://www.nytimes.com/1989/11/10/nyregion/opposition-to-charter-change-diverse.html>

<sup>18</sup> Alan Finder, *The 1989 Elections: Charter; Putting New Government in Place Will Take Time*, N.Y. TIMES, Nov. 9, 1989, <http://www.nytimes.com/1989/11/09/nyregion/the-1989-elections-charter-putting-new-government-in-place-will-take-time.html>

<sup>19</sup> Alan Finder, *New York City Charter Revision Approved by Justice Department*, N.Y. Times, Dec. 14, 1989, <http://www.nytimes.com/1989/12/14/nyregion/new-york-city-charter-revision-approved-by-justice-department.htm>

## **BIOGRAPHICAL NOTE:**

Judge David G. Trager (December 23, 1937 - January 5, 2011) was born in Mount Vernon, New York. He completed his undergraduate studies at Columbia University (1959) and graduated from Harvard Law School (1962).

In 1963, he began his legal career in private practice in New York City (1963-1967) under the tutelage of the great trial lawyer Emile Zola Berman.

In 1967, David Trager left private practice to pursue a legal career in public service. He first served as an Assistant Corporation Counsel for New York City (1967), then as a law clerk to New York State Court of Appeals Judge Kenneth B. Keating (1968-1969) and New York State Court of Appeals Chief Judge Stanley H. Fuld (1969). He also worked as an Assistant United States Attorney and Chief of the Appeals Division for United States Attorney for the Eastern District of New York (1970-1972). In 1972, David Trager began to teach law, joining the faculty of Brooklyn Law School as an Associate Professor of Law (1972-1974).

Two years later, Trager, a Republican known for political independence, was appointed as United States Attorney for the Eastern District of New York (1974-1978). He remained in office during the presidential administrations of Gerald R. Ford, a Republican, and Jimmy Carter, a Democrat.

In 1978, David Trager returned to Brooklyn Law School as Professor of Law (1978-1983). In 1983, he was appointed Dean of Brooklyn Law School (1983-1993). During his tenure as dean, Trager expanded the school's faculty, supported the development of legal clinical programs, and expanded the school's facilities by building an annex and opening the first student residence hall.

While working at Brooklyn Law School, Dean Trager continued his public service as a member of two successive New York City Charter Revision Commissions (1986-1989). He also served on the New York City Mayor's Committee on the Judiciary (1981-1990), as Chair of the Temporary New York State Commission on Investigations (1983-1990), and as President of the Federal Bar Council (1983-1990).

After three decades as a lawyer, state investigation commissioner, federal prosecutor, and law school professor and dean, David Trager was appointed to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York by President Bill Clinton in 1993. Judge Trager assumed senior status on March 1, 2006.

Judge Trager died on January 5, 2011 at the age of 73.

## **PROCESSING ARCHIVIST'S NOTES:**

1. Document control number is indicated by superscript at the end of the description of the item it denotes.
2. Letters are copies unless otherwise indicated.
3. A few item-specific conservation issues are indicated by bold capitals.
4. Highlighted documents have been digitized.

### **SUB-GROUP A: GENERAL (1986-1990)**

#### **Formerly Housed In Looseleaf Binders Acquired In 2011**

Binder 1(Folders A1-A4): Briefing Book, Summer 1987 (some materials dated 1/12/88; see documents #216-220A)

1. Cover page on card stock with cutout
2. Title Page
3. Table of Contents
4. Tab: "Introduction" (n.b. Contents missing.)
5. Tab: "Elected Officials"
  - a. Contents Page covering Sections II-A – II-E
  - b. Mayor (Section II-A)
  - c. President of the Council (Section II-B)
  - d. Comptroller (Section II-C)
  - e. Borough Presidents (Section II-D)
  - f. Board of Estimate (Section II-E)
  - g. Letters (7) from the Borough Presidents
  - h. City Council (Section II-F)
  - i. Summary of Proportional Representation Charter Used In New York City
  - j. Newspaper clippings on Proportional Representation
6. Tab: "Community Governance"
  - a. Contents Page covering section [III?] (n.b. This section not divided by subsection; only by headings.)
  - b. Briefing materials
7. Tab: "Executive Branch Organization" (n.b. Contents missing.)
8. Tab: "Line Agencies/Functions"
  - a. Contents Page covering Sections V-C and V-D
  - b. Land Use Planning and Project Review (Section V-C)
  - c. Franchises and Revocable Consents (Section V-D)
9. Tab: "Staff Agencies/Functions (Financial)"
  - a. Contents Page covering Sections VI-A – VI-D, VI-F, VI-G
  - b. Expense Budget (Section VI-A)
  - c. Capital Planning and Budgeting (Section VI-B)
  - d. Debt Management (Section VI-C)
  - e. Cash Management (Section VI-D)
  - f. Auditing (Section VI-F)
  - g. Accounting and Financial Reporting (Section VI-G)
10. Tab: "Staff Agencies/Functions (Other)"
  - a. Contents Page covering VII-A – VII-J
  - b. Contracting and Procurement (Section VII-A)
  - c. Administrative Rule-Making (Section VII-B)
  - d. Program Planning (Section VII-C)
  - e. Personnel Management (Section VII-D)
  - f. Performance and Other Non-Financial Reporting (Section VII-E)
  - g. Property Management (Section VII-F)
  - h. Records Management (Section VII-G)
  - i. City Clerk (Section VII-H)
  - j. Corporation Counsel (Section VII-I)
  - k. Public Construction (Section VII-J)
11. Tab: "Special Issues"

- a. Contents Page covering Sections VIII-A, VIII-C
- b. Ethics (Section VIII-A)
- c. Internal Control Framework (Section VIII-B)
- d. Public Participation Requirements (Section VIII-C)<sup>1</sup>

1. Alternate table of contents for “Briefing Book / Summer, 1987”<sup>1A</sup>

Binder 2 (Folder A5): Materials for Private Hearings on Council President

- 1. Contents
- 2. Title Page: “Annotated Charter Provisions” followed by Xerox copies of pages from McKinney’s
- 3. Title Page: “Briefing Paper on the President of the Council”
  - a. Contents page (numbered II-B-1)
  - b. Charter Provisions (numbered II-B-3) – list of provisions relevant to Office of City Council President
  - c. Materials and questions re: Office of Council President
- 4. Title page: “Summary of Testimony”
  - a. Outline
  - b. Appendix A – Alphabetized list of speakers
  - c. Appendix B
    - i. Public Hearing, Staten Island, 4/22/87 (List of speakers)
    - ii. Public Hearing, Brooklyn, 4/23/87 (List of speakers)
    - iii. Public Hearing, Queens, 4/28/87 (List of speakers)
    - iv. Public Hearing, Bronx, 4/29/87 (List of speakers)
    - v. Public Hearing, Manhattan, 4/30/87 (List of speakers)
    - vi. Public Hearing, Citywide, 5/7/87 (List of speakers)
- 5. Title page: “Goodman Report”
  - a. Summary box of Council President’s job
  - b. Contents page
  - c. Discussion of Council President’s job and Alternatives
  - d. Appendix A – List of Mayor’s and Council Presidents 1938 – 1973
  - e. Appendix B – Current Charter provisions
- 6. Title page: “Municipal Year Book”
  - a. 72 Municipal Year Book Table 1/7 Mayor as Council Member, and Presiding Officer of Council
- 7. Title page: “Mario Cuomo Article”
  - a. Press Release from Lieutenant Governor’s Office: “Cuomo Asks Full-Time Pledge from Lieutenant Governor Candidates” and “A Proposal” (2 copies)
- 8. Title page: “Legislative Report on Lieutenant Governor”
  - a. Report, including cover page and table of contents
  - b. Appendix Cover page
    - i. Letter from former Lt. Gov. Malcolm Wilson
- 9. Cover page: “Common Cause Report”; New Jersey Lieutenant Governor’s Report, April 1982, including cover page and table of contents
- 10. Cover page: “12 and 14 Amendments to the U.S. Constitution” (photocopy)



11. Cover page: "ABA Symposium Transcript"; "Symposium on the Vice Presidency" held 12/3/76 at Fordham University School of Law, 45 Fordham Law Review 703 (1977) (photocopy)
12. Cover page: "Arthur Schlesinger Article"; "On the Presidential Succession," Political Science Quarterly 89:3 (fall 1974) (photocopy)<sup>2</sup>

Binder 3 (Folder A6): Materials re: First Private Hearing (Ethics)

1. Original, signed letter dated 9/14/87 from Eric Lane to David G. Trager detailing enclosures<sup>3</sup>
2. Cover memorandum dated 10/6/87 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: summary of questions & answers at private hearing on ethics held 9/22/87<sup>4</sup>
3. Memorandum to file dated 9/29/87 from Linda Gibbs re: "Summary of the Private Hearing on Ethics"<sup>5</sup>
4. Tab: January 20, 1989
  - a. Minutes of 1/20/89 meeting of NYCCRC<sup>6</sup>
  - b. Transcript of same<sup>7</sup>
5. Tab: February 16, 1989
  - a. Minutes of 2/16/89 meeting of NYCCRC<sup>8</sup>
  - b. Transcript of same<sup>9</sup>
6. Tab: March 31, 1989
  - a. Record of Motions and Votes March 31, 1989 Meeting<sup>10</sup>

Binder 4 (Folder A7): Cover memorandum dated 10/6/87 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Private Hearings on Contracting"<sup>11</sup>; "Also enclosed as further background for the hearing are the following materials" (See Binder A1)

Binder 4 (Binder A1): Title from original cover: Contracting and Procurement: Materials for Private Hearings: October 15 and 20, 1987; table of contents transcribed below

1. Annotated Charter Provisions
2. Briefing Paper on Contracting and Procurement
3. Summary of Testimony on Contracting from Public Hearings
4. Provisions of the [ABA] Model Procurement Code
5. [cover memorandum dated 10/5/87 from Linda Gibbs to Frank J. Mauro and Eric Lane;] Summary of the Model Procurement Code
6. Recommendations of the Sovern Commission ["State-City Commission on Integrity in Government: Report and Recommendations Relating to City Procurement and Contracts" dated 11/19/86]
7. Report by the State Comptroller ["Reforming the Contract Process in New York City" dated 9/11/86]
8. Bill and Memorandum in Support by the State Comptroller ["Regan Bill"]
9. Recommendations by the Non-Profit Coordinating Committee of New York
10. Recommendations of the Institute of Public Administration [executive summary]
11. State of the Art in Procurement by the Institute of Public Administration
12. Bibliography
13. Tables<sup>12</sup>

Folders A8-A9:

1. Transcript: "Public Meeting - 8/10/88": Tapes 1-5 (CRC members; 284 pp. total)<sup>13</sup>

2. Transcript: "Public Meeting 8/23/88" (unidentified speakers; 43 pp.)<sup>14</sup>
3. Transcript: "Meeting of the / New York City / Charter Revision Commission // Bar Association / 42 West 44th Street / New York, New York // Tuesday / September 20, 1988 / 8:15 a.m." (64 pp.)<sup>15</sup>

Binder 5 (Folder A10): Miscellaneous materials pertaining to public meetings

1. "Public Notice" of 5/18/88 meeting to be held at Brooklyn Law School<sup>16</sup>; directions to restrooms etc.<sup>16A</sup>
2. Memorandum dated 5/10/88 from Lynn Miller to Eric Lane re: "Summary of voting history ... Mayoral Inability Proposal"<sup>17</sup>
3. "Mayoral Inability" (outline)<sup>18</sup>
4. "Mayoral Inability / draft-A 5-18-88"<sup>19</sup>
5. Tab
  - a. Cover memorandum dated 5/13/88 from Frank J. Mauro to NYCCRC members re: Materials on Internal Controls<sup>20</sup>
  - b. Internal Control Framework, including table of contents, schematic of Charter provisions<sup>21</sup>
  - c. Internal Controls Proposal<sup>22</sup>
  - d. Charter provisions – marked wth brackets and underlining for proposed revisions<sup>23</sup>
  - e. Memorandum dated 5/11/88 from E. Sullivan to Frank J. Mauro re: Recommendations of Committee on Municipal Affairs on DOI<sup>24</sup>
  - f. Committee on Municipal Affairs report: "The New York City Department of Investigation"<sup>25</sup>
  - g. Codification of Statements on Auditing Standards / Numbers 1 to 23 by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants: "AU Section 320" (photocopy)<sup>26</sup>
6. Tab
  - a. Cover memorandum dated 5/16/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: enclosed materials<sup>27</sup> (2 copies)
  - b. Summary of Motions/Votes at May 9, 1988 Public Meeting<sup>28</sup> (2 copies; n.b. differs from document #36)
  - c. Memorandum dated 5/16/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: Proposal to adopt City Administrative Procedure Act<sup>29</sup> (2 copies)
  - d. Draft: "Chapter 00 / City Administrative Procedure Act"<sup>30</sup> (2 copies)
  - e. Letter dated 5/9/88 from Gene Russianoff (Citizens for Charter Change) to Eric Lane, Linda Gibbs re: "Prohibitions on Solicitation of Campaign Contributions by Ranking City Officials"<sup>31</sup> (for second copy, see document #86; n.b. attachments missing)
  - f. Letter dated 12/31/87 from Queens Borough President Claire Shulman to Richard Ravitch re: ethics and conflicts of interest provisions, with attachments<sup>32</sup>
  - g. "Questions Concerning Independent Legal Representation For Elected Officials And Entities of City Government"<sup>33</sup>
  - h. "Questions Concerning Independent Legal Representation For Elected Officials And Entities of City Government" (on Charter Commission letterhead)<sup>34</sup>

Binder 6 (Folder A11): Materials for June 3, 1988 meeting (see also document #406)

1. Cover memorandum dated 5/26/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members<sup>35</sup>
2. Tab

- a. Summary of Motions/Votes of May 9, 1988 Public Meeting<sup>36</sup> (n.b. differs from document #28)
- b. Summary of Motions/Votes of May 18, 1988 Public Meeting<sup>37</sup>
- 3. Tab
  - a. Memorandum dated 5/25/88 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: "Resolution of Outstanding Issues on Ethics"<sup>38</sup>
  - b. Memorandum dated 5/24/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: "Composition and Jurisdiction of One or More Boards of Ethics"<sup>39</sup>
  - c. "Discussion Paper: Options For Composition And Jurisdiction Of One Or More Conflict Of Interest Boards"<sup>40</sup>
  - d. Board of Ethics Opinion Nos. 77-78<sup>41</sup>, 92<sup>42</sup>, 169-70<sup>43</sup>, 286-87<sup>44</sup>, and 674<sup>45</sup>
- 4. Tab
  - a. Executive Order No. 32, July 25, 1979, Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings<sup>46</sup>
  - b. Report and Recommendation, Index No. 153/82<sup>47</sup>
  - c. Report and Recommendation, Index No. 309/85<sup>48</sup>
  - d. "New York City Office Of Administrative Trials And Hearings Annual Report Fiscal Year 1986" (photocopy)<sup>49</sup>
- 5. Tab
  - a. "Chapter 00 / City Administrative Procedure Act / Draft, 5/23/88"<sup>50</sup>
  - b. Memorandum dated 5/25/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Tribunal For Appealing Nonproperty Tax Determinations" with enclosures<sup>51</sup>
    - i. Cover memorandum dated 5/23/88 from Roger Furman to Eric Lane and Frank J. Mauro re: "Tribunal for Determining Appeals of the Department of Finance's Nonproperty Tax Determinations" with attached:
    - ii. Draft of proposed new chapter of Charter creating Administrative Tribunal<sup>52</sup>
- 6. Tab
  - a. Draft: "Chapter \_\_ / Voter Assistance / May 26, 1988"<sup>53</sup> (see document #531)
- 7. Tab
  - a. Memorandum dated 5/20/88 from Lynn Miller to Commission Members re: "Disability allowance for mayor who has been determined to be unable to discharge the functions of the office of mayor"<sup>54</sup>
- 8. Tab
  - a. Letter dated 5/6/88 from New York State Comptroller Edward V. Regan to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: concern over need for more systemic maintenance of public capital facilities<sup>55</sup>
  - b. "Explanatory Statement: Proposed Amendments to New York City Charter on Maintenance of the Capital Plant" by the Office of the New York State Comptroller with attached:
  - c. Proposal of New York State Comptroller re: capital plant maintenance<sup>56</sup>
- 9. Tab
  - a. Memorandum (stamped "DRAFT") dated 5/25/88 from Roger Furman to Eric Lane re: "Proposals for Providing Elected Officials, Certain Other Officials and Certain Entities the Express Right to Retain Counsel Independent of the Corporation Counsel"<sup>57</sup>

Binder 7 (Folder A12): Agenda and materials for June 13, 1988 meeting

- 1. Tabbed attachments (hand numbered, tab numbers correspond to Agenda item number)

2. Cover memorandum dated 6/9/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: “Materials for Meeting, June 13, 1988” with attached Table of Contents
  - a. 3. Mayoral Inability – Cover page and 3 documents
  - b. 4. Filling Vacancies – Cover page and 3 documents
  - c. 5. Internal Control – 3 documents
  - d. 6a. Appeals of Excise & other non-property taxes – 2 documents
  - e. 6b. Staff responses to agency proposals and letters from commissioners/agencies requesting revisions (see documents #238-239)
  - f. 9. Infrastructure maintenance – Staff recommendation + explanatory statement<sup>58</sup>
    - i. Cover memorandum dated 6/10/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: “Additional Materials For June 13 Meeting”<sup>58A</sup>;
    - ii. Cover memorandum dated 6/10/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: “Draft Proposals On Other Administrative Reforms” with revised draft Charter chapters attached<sup>58D</sup> (n.b. other two “Additional Materials” missing)

Binder 8 (Folders A13-A14): NYCCRC Label on Cover “Public Meeting, June 13, 1988”

1. Agenda
2. directions to restrooms etc. (2 copies)
3. Table of Contents
4. Tab: “1” – Cover memorandum from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members and amended proposed chapter on “Conflicts of Interest”
5. Tab: “2”
  - a. Letter from Richard Ravitch to Commission Members re: Campaign Finance Reform
  - b. Materials on Campaign Finance (Table of Contents)
    - i. Proposed Charter Language on Campaign Finance Reform
    - ii. Comparison of Local Law 8 and Proposed Charter Language On Campaign Finance Reform
  - c. Campaign Finance Reform for New York City, A Critical Analysis of Local Law 8 of 1988
  - d. Public Campaign Financing, Issues and Options
  - e. Local Law 8 and a Summary (2 copies of pages 15-25 of Local Law 8 and Summary)
6. Tab: “3” – Mayoral Inability
  - a. Proposal approved at 5/18/88 public meeting
  - b. Staff memorandum from Lynn Miller to Commission Members re: Proposed amendments to mayoral inability proposal approved 5/18/88
  - c. Mayoral Inability Proposal with amendments
7. Tab: “4” – Filling Vacancies
  - a. Table of Contents
  - b. Proposals for filling vacancies in City Council, Borough President and Comptroller, as adopted by the Commission
  - c. Memorandum from Staff to Commission members re: (i) revisions to Commission’s adopted proposals for filling vacancies; and (ii) proposed Charter amendments for special elections to fill vacancies
  - d. Proposals, with amendments, for filling vacancies in City Council, Borough President and Comptroller
8. Tab: “5” – Internal Control

- a. Memorandum from Frank J. Mauro to Commission Members re: Internal Control (Revised Proposal and Supporting Materials)
  - b. "Options For Strengthening the Internal Control Responsibilities . . ." report by A. Confas, consultant to Commission
  - c. "An Internal Control Perspective on Charter Revision" report by A. Confas, consultant to Commission
  - d. Sections 1-13 of Charter
9. Tab: "6" – City Administrative Procedure Act (Draft, 6/10/1988)
10. Tab: "6A" – Proposed Tax Appeals Tribunal
- a. Cover memorandum from Roger Furman to NYCCRC members
  - b. Memorandum from Department of Finance re: Proposed Tax Tribunal
  - c. Cover memorandum from Roger Furman to Eric Lane and Frank J. Mauro re: Tribunal for Determining appeals of Dep't of Finance's Nonproperty Tax Determinations
  - d. Proposed chapter for Charter "Excise and Non-Property Tax Appeals Tribunal"
11. Tab: "6B" – Agency Proposals
- a. Cover memorandum from Eric Lane to Richard Ravitch re: Proposals of Agencies
  - b. Outline of agency proposals and staff recommendations
  - c. Suggested language for proposals the staff recommends
  - d. Various memoranda re: proposed amendments to/from agencies, Mayor Koch and the Commission
  - e. Cover memorandum from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: Draft Proposals on Other Administrative Reforms
  - f. Revised Charter Chapters (drafts)
12. Tab: "7"
- a. Questions Concerning Independent Legal Representation (on NYCCRC letterhead)
  - b. Memorandum (stamped "DRAFT") from Roger Furman to Eric Lane re: "Proposals for providing Elected Officials, [...] the Express Right to Retain Counsel Independent of the Corporate Counsel."
13. Tab: "8" – Voter Assistance
- a. Draft chapter for Charter "Voter Assistance"
  - b. Memorandum from J. Travis to Eric Lane re: Proposed Voter Assistance Provisions
14. Tab: "9"
- a. Memorandum from Staff to Commission Members re: Infrastructure maintenance
  - b. Cover letter from Edward V. Regan to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: proposed Charter amendments concerning maintenance of public capital facilities
  - c. Explanatory Statement re: Proposed Amendments to New York City Charter on Maintenance of the Capital Plant
  - d. Proposed amendments re: Capital Plant Maintenance
  - e. Marked pages showing changes to Charter for proposed amendments 2, 4 and 5
  - f. Appendix B – Legislative History of Assembly Bills Relating to Infrastructure maintenance Budgeting with attached Assembly Bills<sup>59</sup>

Binder 9 (Folder A15): Label on Front Cover "PRELIMINARY PROPOSALS (June 21, 1988)"

- 1. Cover memorandum dated 6/21/88
- 2. 10 Tabbed (unlabeled) sections (topical) except as detailed below, each tab contains: Overview of Commission's work; summary of goals/proposals; full text of new proposals

- a. Administrative Procedures
- b. Reorganizing the Charter
- c. Special Elections
- d. Internal Controls – this tab has overview, summary of proposals, discussion of proposals and a report from consultant A. Cofnas. No full text of new proposals
- e. Voter Assistance – this tab has overview and proposed new Chapter, no summary. Pages were duplicated out of sequence
- f. Campaign Finance Reform – also has questions/clarification re: proposal
- g. Conflicts of Interests
- h. Tax Appeals
- i. Infrastructure Maintenance
- j. Mayoral Inability<sup>60</sup>

Binder 10 (Folders A16-A17): NYCCRC Label on Front Cover “Public Hearing Transcripts (*unbound, unedited*) June 27-30, 1988”

- 1. Cover memorandum from Eric Lane to NYCCRC Members
- 2. Tab “Staten Island”
  - a. Transcript – June 27, 1988, 6:15 p.m.
- 3. Tab “Bronx”
  - a. Transcript – June 28, 1988, 5:30 p.m.
- 4. Tab “Queens”
  - a. Transcript – June 29, 1988, 6:00 p.m.
- 5. Tab “Brooklyn”
  - a. Transcript – June 30, 1988, 9:30 a.m.
- 6. Tab “Manhattan”
  - a. Transcript – June 30, 1988, 5:30 p.m.<sup>61</sup>

Binder 11 (Folders A18-A19): NYCCRC Label on Front Cover “Written Testimony 1988”

- 1. Cover memorandum from Eric Lane to NYCCRC Members re: Written Testimony divided into testimony (a) read into the record (subdivided by borough), (b) submitted without oral presentation and (c) mailed (see documents #409 and 414)
- 2. Tab labeled “Bronx”
  - a. letter dated 6/28/88 from Christina North to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch and NYCCRC members, attaching 6/10/88 letter to Mayor Koch and flyer dated 1/23/88
  - b. “Charter Reform—Health / Toward A Healthier New York” “prepared by Marshall England / Chair, Health Committee / 2/17/88”
- 3. Tab labeled “Queens”
  - a. Queens Borough President Claire Shulman’s testimony
  - b. Ridgewood Bushwick Senior Citizens Council’s testimony
  - c. Mid-Queens Community Council’s statement
  - d. Briarwood Community Association’s recommendations; Queens Chamber of Commerce’s remarks
- 4. Tab labeled “Brooklyn”
  - a. Testimony of E. I. Koch (Mayor of City of NY)
  - b. Executive Order No. 101 (Dec 8, 1986)
  - c. Agency-Based Voter Registration

- d. New York City Managerial Employees Association cover letter and proposed amendment to Charter and memorandum in support
  - e. Testimony of Howard Golden (President of the Borough of Brooklyn)
  - f. Testimony of C.W. Neu (The Schip Program)
  - g. Testimony by Alvin M. Berk (Community Board 14, Brooklyn)
  - h. Statement of J.D. Feerick (Dean, Fordham Law School; Chairman, NYS Commission on Government Integrity)
  - i. Testimony presented on behalf of The New York Building Congress and The Council of Business and Labor
  - j. Testimony of Monsignor H. Basler (Catholic Charities Diocese of Brooklyn)
  - k. Testimony of E. Mililli
  - l. Testimony of C. North
  - m. Testimony of R. Ashford
  - n. Testimony of Citizens Union of the City of New York (2 copies)
  - o. Comments of New York State Common Cause
  - p. Testimony of Center for Law and Social Justice
  - q. Testimony of The Creator's Educational Crusade, Inc.
5. Tab labeled "Manhattan"
- a. Testimony of Edward V. Regan (NYS Comptroller)
  - b. Testimony of Women's City Club of New York, Inc.
  - c. Testimony of Gene Russianoff (New York Public Interest Research Group, Inc.)
  - d. Testimony of L. Davidoff (Executive Director, Human Service Employees Registration and Voter Education Campaign)
  - e. Testimony of Ms. L. Guanlo (Director, The Little Missionary's Day Nursery)
  - f. Testimony of R. Levinson (Co-Chair, Committee on NYC Tax Matters, Tax Section of NYS Bar Association)
  - g. Testimony of Neighborhood Open Space Coalition
  - h. Testimony of L. Altschuler, President and H. Sheldon, Director, City Affairs of League of Women voters of The City of New York
  - i. Testimony of New York Lawyers for the Public Interest, Inc.
  - j. Testimony of D. Corrigan, District Leader, Female, 64 AD, Part A
  - k. Statement of A. Cheliotis (President, Communications Workers of America, Local 1180)
  - l. Testimony of Ruth Messinger (City Council Member; Co-Chair, Citizens for Charter Change)
  - m. Photocopied clipping: G.N. Spitz, "City Funds For Media Gurus?", Newsday, 5/5/88
  - n. Testimony of K. Conlin (President, NYC Chapter National Organization of Women)
  - o. Letter from M.L. Madison to CB Charter Action Committee
  - p. Flyer re: protest over Salvation Army in Harlem
  - q. Copy of article "Like It Was" by Mary McLeod Bethune re: black history
  - r. Copy of "Letter to the Editor" from M.L. Madison re: anti-Semitism not different from any other form of racism
  - s. Testimony of W. Armstrong (President, Park West Village Tenants Association)
  - t. "Recommendation for Longer Term Economic Measures in Project Evaluation and City Planning" (author not identified, but address and phone number appear)
6. Tab labeled "Staten Island (no written testimony)"
7. Tab labeled "Submitted/no oral presentation"

- a. David N. Dinkins (Borough President, Manhattan) Charter Revision Commission Testimony
  - b. Comments of M. Brendle
  - c. Testimony of Sister Joan Kirby (President of Homes for the Homeless)
  - d. Testimony of Co-Op City Council
  - e. Statement of B. Benepe (Vice President, Fine Arts Federation)
  - f. Statement of Helen D. Henkin (Chairperson, Brooklyn Community Board 14)
  - g. Recommendations of the Brooklyn District Managers (2 copies)
8. Tab labeled "Submitted by mail"
- a. Note from D. Feldman (Member of Assembly)
  - b. Letter from M. Friedlander (Council Woman)
  - c. Testimony of A. Boyers
  - d. Statement by H. Carter (President, Emanuel Pieterseon Historical Society) before a public forum: City University Graduate Center
  - e. Cover letter with attached articles from P.D. Moss to Eric Lane re: campaign finance "reform"<sup>62</sup>

Binder 12 (Folders A20-A24): Cover page: photocopy bearing NYCCRC logo and "David G. Trager" typewritten<sup>63</sup>

1. Memorandum dated 8/23/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC presenting draft Charter revision ballot questions with handwritten alteration<sup>64A</sup>; memorandum dated 8/24/88 from Linda Lange to David G. Trager re: "Charter Book"<sup>64B</sup>; cover letter dated 8/23/88 from NYCCRC to City Clerk re: Charter revision ballot questions<sup>64C</sup> (n.b. Post-It note formerly attached: "insert in left cover sleeve"); "Ballot Questions" (revised)<sup>64D</sup> (see documents #402-407 and 415); "Notice Of Effectuation"<sup>64E</sup>; memorandum dated 8/24/88 from Frank J. Mauro to NYCCRC members re: "Separation Of Proposed Revisions If Question 1 Is Approved But Question 2 Isn't, And Vice Versa"<sup>64F</sup>; "Conformity of Written Draft to Final Proposals for Filing with the City Clerk Adopted at the Meeting of August 10, 1988"<sup>65A</sup> (2 copies); "Revised / Conformity of Written Draft to Final Proposals for Filing with the City Clerk Adopted at the Meeting of August 10, 1988"<sup>65B</sup>; "Alternate Chapter 52"<sup>65C</sup> (n.b. Post-It note formerly attached: "insert after page 391"); pages 5, 93-94, 115, 195-196, 265, 294, 342, 353, and 384 of proposed Charter<sup>65D</sup> (n.b. Post-It note formerly attached: "replacement pages")
2. Charter of the City of New York – proposed by the New York City Charter Revision Commission, August 1988 (draft; changes to then existing Charter indicated by brackets and underlining, one handwritten revision noted on page 5)<sup>66</sup>

Binder 13 (Folders A25-A27):

1. Memorandum from Eric Lane dated 9/9/88 to NYCCRC members re: Final Charter (in front pocket of binder)<sup>67</sup>
2. Label on spine: "Charter / Of The / City Of New York, copy 2 (proposed August 1988)"; title page: "Final-554 / 9/2/88 / Charter / Of The / City of New York / Proposed by the / New York City Charter Revision Commission / August 1988"<sup>68</sup>; including correction of typographical errors; n.b. page 392 missing or out of sequence

Binder 14 (Folders A28-A30):

1. "The Money-Go-Round / Part 5 / A Visual Aid Toward Understanding New York City's Contract Process" [by the] League of Women Voters of the City of New York Education Fund<sup>69</sup>; n.b. bleeding from Table of Contents of binder on cover page



2. Label on front cover: "Public Hearing / Contracting And Procurement / March 1, 1989" with handwritten "DAVID TRAGER". New York City Charter Review Commission Label on front cover; Post-It note on front cover: "II"
3. Table of Contents – heading on page is "Exhibit Book – Contracting and Procurement, March 1, 1989" **HOLES TORN**
4. Tab "I"
  - a. Hearing Plan, Contracting and Procurement, March 1, 1989 (Outline of 4 sessions)
  - b. List of guest witnesses, divided into 4 panels
  - c. Chapter 13, Contracts and Purchases (draft?)
  - d. Chapter 1 of Title 6 of New York Administrative Code (Xerox copy of [McKinney's] and Cumulative Supplement)
  - e. Charter Exceptions to Generally Applicable Procurement Rules
  - f. Public Participation in the Contracting Process
5. Tab "IIA"
  - a. Background Statement: Source Selection and Contract Approval (prepared for use at public hearing March 1, 1989)
6. Tab "IIB"
  - a. Background Statement: Performance Evaluations and Contract Information (prepared for use at public hearing March 1, 1989)
7. Tab "IIB"
  - a. Background Statement: Contract Dispute Resolution Mechanisms in New York City (prepared for use at public hearing March 1, 1989)
8. Tab "IIIA"
  - a. Subtabs 1.a-1.k, 2.a-2.f, 3.a-3.e – assorted documents related to process for awarding contracts **TABS ARE VERY FRAGILE AND LOOSE, ATTACHED TO BLUE SLIPSHEETS, MAY NEED REGLUING OR REPLACING**
9. Tab "IIIB"
  - a. Subtabs 1.b, 2, 3.a-3.e -- various documents related to administrative procedures for contract process (request for proposal, computer coding, evaluation) **NO TAB 1.A. TABS FRAGILE AND LOOSE**
10. Tab "IIIC"
  - a. Subtabs 1, 2, 4 – materials relating to debarring vendors **NO TAB 3**
11. Tab "IIID"
  - a. Subtabs 1-4—various reports on contracting process in NYC<sup>70</sup>

Binder 15 (Folder A31): label on front cover: "Public Hearing / Franchising / March 14, 1989"; NYCCRC label on front cover; label: "Please Do Not Remove" on front cover.

1. Table of Contents
2. Tab "1"
  - a. Witnesses at hearing (divided into 3 Panels)
3. Tab "2"
  - a. Paper re: Franchises, Revocable Consents, Concessions, Licenses and Permits
4. Tab "3"
  - a. Approval Process for Franchises (Chart)
5. Tab "4"
  - a. Agencies To Whom Petitions [for franchising] are Circulated
6. Tab "5"

- a. Executive Order No.9, March 16, 1978
- 7. Tab "6"
  - a. Opinion No. 46-79 from Corporation Counsel to Howard Golden (Borough President of Brooklyn)
- 8. Tab "7"
  - a. Concessions Review Committee Rules (As amended, to 2-25-83)
- 9. Tab "8"
  - a. Actions taken by Concessions review Committee 7/1/87 – 6/30/88
- 10. Tab "9"
  - a. Sections relating to Community Access from Agreement between Cablevision Systems and New York City Corporation
- 11. Tab "10"
  - a. Glossary<sup>71</sup>

Binder 16 (Folders A32-A33): label on front cover: "Public Hearing / Budgeting / March 15, 1989" [illegible on photocopy]; NYCCRC label also on front cover.

- 1. Table of Contents **DOESN'T MATCH INDIVIDUAL TAB TOCS**
- 2. Tab "1"
  - a. Contents
  - b. Public Hearing Panels
  - c. 4 charts / tables describing budget process
  - d. Report prepared for CRC describing Budget process
- 3. Tab "2"
  - a. Contents - 1989 Adopted Budget Summary/Resolutions
  - b. 9 documents re: amendments/adoptions of budget
- 4. Tab "3"
  - a. Contents
  - b. 4 documents re: financial estimates and plans
- 5. Tab "4"
  - a. Contents
  - b. Fiscal Year 1990 Police Dept. estimates
- 6. Tab "5"
  - a. Contents
  - b. Extension of Charter-Mandated Budget Submission Due Dates
  - c. Community Board Budget Requests
- 7. Tab "6"
  - a. Contents
  - b. 3 documents re: Budget Preparation Instructions
- 8. Tab "7"
  - a. Contents
  - b. 2 documents – Charter chapters 6 and 9 re: budgets
- 9. Tab "8"
  - a. Contents
  - b. 7 documents re: Dept. of Juvenile Justice Budget
- 10. Tab "9"
  - a. Contents
  - b. 9 documents re: Financial Plans, Estimates, Budgets for Fiscal Years 1987-1992

11. Tab "10"
  - a. The Implementation of the Capital Budget
12. Tab "11"
  - a. Capital Budget Findings and Preliminary Recommendations
13. Tab "12"
  - a. Adopted Capital Budget for Fiscal Year 1989
14. Tab "13"
  - a. Pages from Fiscal Year 1988 & 1989 budgets, Fiscal Year 1989 plan & forecast and Fiscal Year 1990 Departmental Estimates re: rehabilitation of Rod Rodgers Dance Company (a city-owned facility)
15. Tab "14"
  - a. C.S. Standards
16. Tab "15"
  - a. Executive Order No. 24, October 27, 1978, establishing office of Director of Construction
17. Tab "16"
  - a. Preliminary Scope and Cost Limitation for construction of Brooklyn 1 & 4 Garage
  - b. Preliminary Scope and Cost Limitation for construction of Manhattan Boro Repair Shop
18. Tab "17"
  - a. 7 "CPs" (contract proposals?) -- preliminary scope approvals
19. Tab "18"
  - a. Model "DACS Project Schedule"<sup>72</sup>

Binder 17 (Folders A34-A35): label on front cover "Proposals Of / Elected Officials / Testifying April 4 And 6 [1989] / Trager [handwritten]"; NYCCRC label.

1. Cover memorandum from Eric Lane to Commission Members
2. Table of Contents **WRINKLED, TEXT SMUDGED, OFFSET**
3. Tab "Manhattan"
  - a. David Dinkins – 4 documents
4. Tab "Messinger"
  - a. Ruth Messinger – 2 documents
5. Tab "Staten Island"
  - a. Ralph Lamberti – 3 documents
6. Tab "Queens"
  - a. Queens Borough President's Charter Revision Proposals (Claire Shulman)
7. Tab "Brooklyn"
  - a. Statement by Brooklyn Borough President Howard Golden
8. Tab "Vallone"
  - a. Charter Revisions Proposals of Majority Leader Vallone
  - b. 2 additional documents
9. Tab "Multi Member"
  - a. Summary Position Paper on Charter Revision
10. Tab "Greitzer"
  - a. Letter to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch
11. Tab "Bronx"
  - a. Fernando Ferrer – 2 documents
12. Tab "Leffler"
  - a. Letter from Sheldon Leffler to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch

13. Tab “Comptroller”
  - a. Sections of Charter with proposals<sup>73</sup>

Binder 18 (Folders A36-A38): May and June 1989 public hearings on NYCCRC proposals; **APPEARS TO BE MISSING A LABEL FROM FRONT COVER**

1. Tab “Staten Island”
  - a. Staten Island Hearing, May 31, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker
  - b. Written text of oral testimony (presumably provided by speakers) (page numbers added for Table of Contents) (30 speakers)
2. Tab “Brooklyn”
  - a. Brooklyn Hearing, June 1, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker
  - b. Written text of oral testimony (presumably provided by speakers) (page numbers added for Table of Contents) (25 speakers)
3. Tab “Bronx”
  - a. Bronx Hearing, June 5, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker
  - b. Written text of oral testimony (presumably provided by speakers) (page numbers added for Table of Contents) (39 speakers)
4. Tab “Manhattan”
  - a. Manhattan Hearing, June 6, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker
  - b. Written text of oral testimony (presumably provided by speakers) (page numbers added for Table of Contents) (49 speakers)
5. Tab “Queens”
  - a. Queens Hearing, June 7, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker
  - b. Written text of oral testimony (presumably provided by speakers; page numbers added for Table of Contents) (63 speakers)<sup>74</sup> (n.b. Table of Contents shows Paul Mader, Chairman, Rosedale Civic Association, p. 98, but testimony from John Dimotta, President; Table of Contents missing Ravi Batra, p. 99.)

Binder 19 (Folder A39): Handwritten label on front cover: “Draft / Charter Language / Trager”:

1. Draft Charter dated 6/25/89<sup>75</sup>

Binder 20 (Folder A40):

1. “Draft Charter Language” (n.b. two different “Table of Contents” pages; sections separated by blue and white slipsheets; pages for Section 29 are misnumbered 28-1, etc.; no slipsheet following section 49)<sup>76</sup>

Binder 21 (Folder A41):

- 1.1 “Draft Language / Of Charter Proposals”<sup>77</sup> with NYCCRC label on cover and address label (“David Trager, Dean [etc.]”); Table of Contents with chapter numbers referring to sections of Charter. Charter proposals indicated by brackets and underlining. Each chapter numbered separately, beginning with “X-1” except chapters 2 and 2a which begin with “2-19” and run continuously; n.b. Last chapter (FISA/OPA) either missing or never included.

Binders 22-23 (Folders A42-A44): NYCCRC label on front cover: "Written Testimony / From Public Hearings / July 17-18, 1989"

1. Tab "Staten Island"
  - a. Staten Island Hearing, July 17, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker (10 speakers)
  - b. Written text of oral testimony (presumably provided by speakers) (page numbers added for Table of Contents) (38 speakers)
2. Tab "Manhattan"
  - a. Manhattan Hearing, July 18, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker (51 speakers)
3. Tab "Queens"
  - a. Queens Hearing, July 19, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker
  - b. Written text of oral testimony (presumably provided by speakers) (page numbers added for Table of Contents) (45 speakers) (n.b. Table of Contents is missing William Scarborough [back of p. 19]);
4. Tab "Bronx"
  - c. Bronx Hearing, July 20, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker
  - d. Written text of oral testimony (presumably provided by speakers) (page numbers added for Table of Contents) (29 speakers)
5. Tab "Brooklyn"
  - e. Brooklyn Hearing, July 21, 1989 -- Table of Contents showing Name, title and affiliation of speaker
  - f. Written text of oral testimony (presumably provided by speakers) (page numbers added for Table of Contents) (38 speakers)<sup>78</sup>

Binder 24 (Folder A45):

1. Proposed Charter: Two handwritten labels scotch-taped to front cover: "Summary of final proposals (Adopted during public meetings on July 31, Aug. 1 and Aug. 2, 1989)"; "Charter of the City of New York (Proposed by the Commission August, 1989)"
2. Cover memorandum dated 8/16/89 from Linda Lange to NYCCRC members re: "Charter and Summary of Final Proposals"<sup>79A</sup>
3. Title page, foreword
4. Table of contents
5. Marked Charter<sup>79B</sup> (n.b. new language underlined, deleted language in brackets)

### **Formerly Housed In Expandable Folders Acquired In 2011**

Expandable Folder 1 (Folders A46-A49):

1. Cover memorandum dated 7/26/88 from Eric Lane<sup>80</sup>
2. Record of Votes at June 13, 1988 Meeting<sup>81</sup>
3. Agency Head responses to proposed City Administrative Procedures Act and Summary of responses with cover memorandum from Rosemarie Maldonado dated 6/29/88<sup>82</sup>
4. Letter dated 6/28/88 from P. Faber (Kaye, Scholer . . .) to Roger Furman re: NYC Tax Appeals Tribunal Proposal<sup>83</sup>

5. Mayor's Office proposed revisions to draft bill on Voter Assistance Program with 2 cover memoranda dated 6/24/88<sup>84</sup>
6. Letter dated 5/11/88 from Claire Shulman (Borough President of Queens) to Richard Ravitch re: Ethics Proposal prohibiting council members and borough presidents from serving on Community Boards with attachments<sup>85</sup> (2 copies; see document #271: identical letter to Trager)
7. Memorandum dated 5/9/88 from Gene Russianoff re: "Prohibitions on Solicitation of Campaign Contributions by Ranking City Officials"<sup>86</sup> (for first copy, see document #31; n.b. attachments missing)
8. Transcript of Public Meeting December 8, 1987<sup>87</sup>
9. Transcript of Public Meeting February 11, 1988<sup>88</sup>
10. Flyer re: Public Hearings 7/17-7/21<sup>89</sup> (2 copies)
11. Memorandum dated 4/10/89 from Eric Lane re: City Council Committee Documents, attaching letter from E. Greeley responding to request for information on City Council's Education Committee<sup>90</sup>
12. Statement of State Senator Franz S. Leichter before NYCCRC April 6, 1989<sup>91</sup>
13. Comments [of Bronx Borough President Fernando Ferrer] at hearing April 6, 1989<sup>92</sup>
14. Testimony of Council President Andrew Stein April 6, 1989<sup>93</sup>
15. Testimony of Queens Borough President Claire Shulman April 4, 1989<sup>94</sup>
16. Testimony of Councilman Hilton B. Clark April 4, 1989<sup>95</sup>
17. Memorandum dated 2/22/88 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: Materials for February 25 Meeting<sup>96</sup>; n.b. attachments missing
18. Draft Charter Provisions dated 6/29/89 – Chapters 2-A, 3, 5, 5-A, 6, 8, 9, 13, 13-A, 13-B, 14, 14-A, and 15<sup>97</sup>
19. "Public Notice" of 8/10/88 meeting<sup>98</sup>; "Agenda For Consideration For November [1988] Ballot"<sup>98A</sup> (see documents #64A-64C and 64F); "Agenda" for 8/10/88 meeting<sup>98B</sup>
20. Draft: Chapter 68 ("Conflicts of Interest") dated 8/8/88<sup>99</sup>
21. Cover memorandum dated 8/8/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members<sup>100A</sup>; "proposal[] on Infrastructure Maintenance [draft Charter: Section 1110-a ('Capital plant inventory and estimates')]" dated 8/8/88<sup>100B</sup> (see document #732); memorandum dated 8/8/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Reorganizing the Charter: Suggested Changes Recommended for Inclusion in Commission's Final Proposal"<sup>100C</sup>; n.b. third enclosure ("slightly modified ethics proposal") missing
22. Summary of Revised Proposals, June 1989 (booklet)<sup>101</sup> (2 copies)
23. Resumen de Propuestas Preliminares, Mayo de 1989 (in Spanish)<sup>102</sup>
24. Summary of Preliminary Proposals, May 1989 (n.b. Post-It note on cover page: "bind")<sup>103</sup>
25. Summary of Preliminary Proposals, summer 1989 (booklet)<sup>104</sup>
26. Comparisons of Borough President Additions (originally stapled to page of 1989 Adopted Budget)<sup>105</sup>
27. Comments on "Independent Counsel for the City Council" (4 pages, KC/rt, D-Rpt. (12), 03-29-88) and "The Power to Appoint the Members of the Districting Commission should Rest with the City Council / NEF:bg, 3-29-88"<sup>106</sup>
28. List of Documents – Brooklyn Law School Library (handwritten in upper right corner "01/24/92 draft") (one penciled correction) (n.b. missing as of 9/12/14)
29. Letter dated 7/27/89 from Alvin M. Berk to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: position on issue of independent counsel for community boards<sup>107</sup>

30. Memorandum dated 6/22/89 from the Law Department: "The Charter Should Not Be Amended To Provide a Right To Independent Counsel"<sup>108</sup>
31. Letter dated 6/23/89 from Mayor Koch to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: thoughts on new issues being considered by Commission<sup>109</sup>
32. Memorandum from Joel N. Copperman, Hadley W. Gold, William J. Grinker to NYCCRC Members re: Contracting – Preliminary Charter Proposals<sup>110</sup>
33. Letter from Elizabeth A. Roistacher to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: Taxi and Limousine Commission with attachments<sup>111</sup>
34. Letter from Richard Ravitch to Honorable Fernando Ferrer in response to comments on initial proposals (attached) (handwritten in upper right "Prof Sara Robbins")<sup>112</sup>
35. Letter from Richard Ravitch to Honorable Howard Golden in response to comments on final proposals (attached) (handwritten in upper right "Prof Sara Robbins")<sup>113</sup>
36. Memorandum from David G. Trager to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch and NYCCRC members re: Basic Structuring of New York City Government<sup>114</sup> (2 copies)

Expandable Folder 2 (Folders A50-A56):

1. Summary of Initial Proposals, Summer 1988 (report bound by 2 staples on left margin)<sup>115</sup> (2 copies)
2. Original, signed letter dated 2/3/88 from Manhattan Borough President David N. Dinkins re: response to CRC press release<sup>116</sup> with attached response dated 2/3/88<sup>117</sup> and 1/14/88 testimony before Commission<sup>118</sup> (3 documents paperclipped together)
3. A Proposal For Charter Reform, submitted by Fernando Ferrer, Bronx Borough President (1988) (Velo bound)<sup>119</sup>
4. Cover memorandum dated 11/18/87 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members<sup>120</sup> with attached proposal from Bronx Borough President Fernando Ferrer, submitted at private hearing Nov. 17, 1987 "Charter Revision, Construction of A County Budget"<sup>121</sup>
5. "Draft / Report Of The New York City Charter Revision Commission / December, 1986 - November, 1988 / November, 1988"<sup>122</sup>
6. David Dinkins's testimony at public hearing, June 6, 1989<sup>123</sup>
7. Written testimony submitted after public hearings held May 31-June 7, 1989<sup>124</sup>
8. Transcript of Testimony, Staten Island Public Hearing, June 27, 1988<sup>125</sup>
9. Transcript of Testimony, Bronx Public Hearing, June 28, 1988<sup>126</sup>
10. The Charter Review: fall 1987, Vol. 1, No. 1<sup>127</sup> (2 copies); winter 1987, Vol. 1, No. 2<sup>128</sup> (2 copies); spring 1988, Vol. 1, No. 3<sup>129</sup> (2 copies); late spring 1988, Vol. 1, No. 4<sup>130</sup> (2 copies); summer 1988, Vol. 1, No. 5<sup>131</sup> (2 copies); fall 1988, Vol. 2, No. 1<sup>132</sup>; 1988 Election Special, Vol. 2, No. 2<sup>133</sup>; winter 1988-89, Vol. 2, No. 3<sup>134</sup>; spring 1989, Vol. 2, No. 4<sup>135</sup> (2 copies); winter 1988-90, Vol. 3, No. 3<sup>136</sup>
11. Cover memorandum dated 7/22/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: Additional Testimony<sup>137</sup>
12. 3 x 5 slip marked "Dup. Copies"<sup>138</sup> clipped to copies of testimony (5 speakers) from June 29, 1988 and June 30, 1988 public hearings<sup>139-143</sup>
13. Memorandum dated 11/28/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: The Final Report<sup>144</sup>
14. The Report, Volume One, New York City Charter Revision Commission, December 1986 – November 1988<sup>145</sup> (2 copies)
15. The Report, Volume Two, New York City Charter Revision Commission, December 1986 – November 1988<sup>146</sup> (2 copies)

16. The Voter's Handbook on Charter Change: Election Day, November 7, 1989<sup>147</sup> (2 copies); [The Voter's Handbook on Charter Change] (in Spanish)<sup>148</sup>; [The Voter's Handbook on Charter Change] (in Chinese)<sup>149</sup>
17. Written testimony from Frank J. Barbaro (Assemblyman), July 18<sup>th</sup>, 1988<sup>150</sup>
18. Charter Testimony, June 6, 1989, of Council Member Ruth W. Messenger, with attachments<sup>151</sup>
19. Memorandum from Gretchen Dykstra to NYCCRC members with attached newspaper clippings from March 1989<sup>152</sup>
20. Newspaper items: 6/11/88<sup>153</sup>, 4/30/89 (2)<sup>154-155</sup>, and 5/1/89<sup>156</sup>; archival photocopy of last item

Expandable Folder 3 (Folders A57-A62):

1. Memorandum dated 9/23/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: Page Changes in the Charter, with attached pages<sup>157</sup>
2. Memorandum dated 7/5/89 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: Charter Language<sup>158</sup>; n.b. enclosures missing
3. Preliminary Proposals, May 1989<sup>159</sup> (2 copies)
4. Loose pages of chapters of draft chapters of Charter, some dated 6/28, some 6/29/89<sup>160</sup>
5. Memorandum dated 6/16/89 from J. Travis to Frederick A.O. Schwarz re: Response to Preliminary Proposals<sup>161</sup>
6. Response to the Preliminary Proposals of the New York City Charter Revision Commission, June 1989, Edward I. Koch, Mayor<sup>162</sup>
7. Proposals by NYCCRC Commissioners Richard Ravitch and David G. Trager, 1988<sup>163</sup>
8. "Charting the Charter: Notes On the Meetings of the 1989 Charter Commission"<sup>164</sup>
9. Cover memorandum dated 4/19/89<sup>165</sup> and attached article "Maps and Misreadings: the Role of Geographic Compactness in Racial Vote Dilution Litigation" from Archibald R. Murray (Executive Director and Attorney-in-Chief, Legal Aid Society) to Eric Lane<sup>166</sup>; handwritten note on memorandum referencing pages 221-236
10. Letter dated 4/18/89 from Lewis H. Hartman to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: additional observations and suggestions<sup>167</sup>
11. Memorandum dated 4/21/89 ("This was unfortunately omitted from my letter of April 18, 1989.")<sup>168</sup> clipped to first copy of "A Proposal for Charter Revision Presented by Brooklyn Borough President Howard Golden"<sup>169</sup> (2 copies)
12. Letter dated 4/27/89 from City Councilman Enoch Williams to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: concern about suggestion for bi-cameral legislature<sup>170</sup>
13. 1989 Public Meetings schedule<sup>171</sup> and [press] Release<sup>172</sup>
14. Recommendations from Alterbudget for Changes in the New York City Budget Process, April 17, 1989<sup>173</sup>
15. Memorandum: "For your information."<sup>174</sup>; letter dated 4/11/89 from Carlos Cuevas, City Clerk, to F.A.O. Schwartz [sic] with attached letter to Richard Ravitch<sup>175</sup>
16. "Recommendations of Citizens Union to the New York City Charter Revision Commission" dated 4/19/89<sup>176</sup>; Citizens Union pamphlet<sup>177</sup>
17. Letter dated 4/7/89 from District Council 37 Executive Director Stanley W. Hill to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz re: issue raised in original testimony before Commission, with attachment<sup>178</sup>
18. Cover memorandum dated 4/5/89 from Howard Golden, President of the Borough of Brooklyn, to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz<sup>179</sup>; memorandum dated 3/25/88 from Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison, consultants to Board of Estimate, to NYCCRC re: Voting Act's Problem<sup>180</sup>



19. Cover memorandum<sup>181</sup>; How Does New York City Work? The Major Processes of City Government, April 1989<sup>182</sup>
20. 1989 Charter Revision Proposals, submitted by Claire Shulman, President of the Borough of Queens (Velo bound)<sup>183</sup>
21. Letter dated 3/22/88 from The New York Historic City Committee Chairman William J. Conklin and Members of the Committee to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: recommendations on future of Landmarks Preservation Commission<sup>184</sup> (see documents #602 and 612-613); and letter from Conklin dated 4/3/89 to Ravitch re: recommendations on future of Landmarks Preservation Commission<sup>185</sup>; New York, The Historic City: A Report Prepared For The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission By The Historic City Committee (2/6/89)<sup>186</sup> (for second copy, see document #600)
22. Original, signed letter dated 4/14/89 from Claire Shulman, President of the Borough of Queens to David G. Trager re: requested preliminary memorandum of law<sup>187</sup>; memorandum of law dated 4/14/89 from Nicholas G. Garaufis and Benjamin Chevat to Frederick A.O. Schwarz and NYCCRC members<sup>188</sup>
23. Cover letter dated 4/28/89 from Peter Vallone to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr.<sup>189</sup>; "Response of Majority Leader Peter F. Vallone and Council Member Hilton B. Clark [...] to the Chair's Recommendations for Charter Revision of April 24, 1989"<sup>190</sup> (2 copies)
24. Memorandum dated 4/27/89 from Eric Lane to Commission members<sup>191</sup>; letter dated 4/17/89 from Andrew J. Stein, President of the Council, to F.A.O. Schwarz Jr. with attached documentation on activities of Ombudsman Unit<sup>192</sup>
25. Cover memorandum dated 4/26/89 from Frank J. Mauro to NYCCRC members with two attached memoranda prepared by Richard Briffault, a consultant to the Commission, on powers of the City and State Comptrollers<sup>193</sup>
26. Table of Contents of Packet of Information and Supporting Documents for Proposed Legislative Budget Office: I. From Summary of Public Hearing, March 9. Representation and Oversight, Panel on Independent Budget Staff Agencies; II. Excerpt of Transcript of March 9, 1989 Hearing on Representation and Oversight, Panel on Independent Budget Staff Agencies; III. Lists and Abstracts of Reports of the Congressional Budget Office<sup>194</sup>
27. Chapter 17-Congressional Budget Office (copy of federal statute)<sup>195</sup>
28. Note clipped to front: "If you're interested: Debarment Pp 96-101"<sup>196</sup>; State of New York Commission of Investigation "Investigation of the Building and Construction Industry: Report of conclusions and Recommendations" December 1985<sup>197</sup>

Expandable Folder 4 (Folders A63-A67):

1. The Voter's Handbook on Charter Change: Election Day / November 8, 1988<sup>198</sup>; [The Voter's Handbook on Charter Change] (in Spanish)<sup>199</sup>; [The Voter's Handbook on Charter Change] (in Chinese)<sup>200</sup>
2. Letter dated 7/20/88 from David Eichenenthal to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch, with attached letter to Peter Vallone, re: ethics/conflicts proposal<sup>201</sup>
3. Letter dated 7/19/88 from Leonard X. Farbman to NYCCRC members re: Administrative Procedures No. 7<sup>202</sup> (2 copies)
4. Memorandum dated 7/19/88 from Peter L. Zimroth to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch and Eric Lane re: draft for "Infrastructure"<sup>203</sup>
5. Letter dated 7/19/88 from Harrison J. Goldin to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: comments on initial proposals of Commission<sup>204</sup>

6. Letter dated 7/18/88 from William G. Van Note, Jr. to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: comments on proposed internal controls amendment<sup>205</sup>
7. Cover memorandum dated 7/18/88 from Rosemarie Maldonado to Eric Lane with attached comments of Department of Transportation and Fire Department<sup>206</sup>
8. Cover memorandum dated 7/15/88 from Rosemarie Maldonado to Eric Lane with attached comments of various city departments<sup>207</sup>
9. Letter dated 7/14/88 from Marc Pillinger to NYCCRC re: Conflict of Interest Provisions<sup>208</sup>
10. Memorandum: "Agenda for June 20-27 [1989] meetings"<sup>209</sup>
11. "Index to Draft Charter Sections distributed at June 20, 1989 Meeting"<sup>210</sup>
12. "Chapter 2 / Council": draft dated 6/18<sup>211</sup>
13. "Chapter 14, Franchises, Revocable Consents and Concessions: Draft 6/21/89"<sup>212</sup>
14. Cover memorandum dated 11/14/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members<sup>213</sup>; "Part III Detailed Analysis of Charter Revisions"<sup>214</sup>
15. Memorandum dated 7/17/88 from Roger Furman to Commission Members re: Tax Appeals<sup>215</sup>
16. 6 memoranda to NYCCRC members, 9/23/87-3/18/88: 3 from Richard Ravitch, 3 from Eric Lane re: Briefing Book (document #1)<sup>216-220A</sup>
17. Cover memorandum dated 3/7/89 from Eric Lane to Commission Members re: Background materials for March 9 [1989] hearing<sup>221</sup>, with attachments<sup>222-224</sup>
18. Cover memorandum dated 1/18/88 from Richard Ravitch to 5 named Commissioners<sup>225</sup> with attached testimony of David Dinkins at 1/14/88 private hearing<sup>226</sup>
19. Cover memorandum dated 11/12/87 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members<sup>227</sup> with attached materials provided by Harrison J. Goldin for private hearing held 11/10/87<sup>228-236</sup>
20. "Land Use Decisions" dated 6/20/89; pencil annotations on first page<sup>237</sup>

Expandable Folder 5 (Folders A68-A73):

1. Note to David G. Trager from Alvin M. Berk re: attached letters expressing concerns about proposals<sup>238</sup> (see Binder 7, Folder A12, Item 2e)
2. Statement by Brooklyn Borough President Howard Golden, 12/14/87<sup>239</sup> (see Binder 17, Folder A35, Item 7)
3. Newspaper article re: Sen. Alphonse D'Amato, 5/11/88<sup>240</sup>
4. Summary of Final Proposals / August 1989<sup>241</sup>
5. Index to Draft Charter Language<sup>242</sup>
6. 4 paperclipped documents: Letter dated 5/24/88 from Manhattan Community Board 2 Chairperson Rosemary McGrath re: "Resolutions, Charter Revision" and "Community Boards"<sup>243</sup>; memorandum dated 6/8/88 from Citizens Union to NYCCRC members re: ballot pamphlet<sup>244</sup>; Board of Elections page showing text and abstract of proposed amendments<sup>245</sup>; Massachusetts / Information for Voters: Ballot Questions '82<sup>246</sup>
7. Original, signed letter dated 3/18/88 from Queens Borough President Claire Shulman to David G. Trager, Commissioner, re: Charter reform recommendations<sup>247</sup> with attachment<sup>248</sup>
8. 1988 / Queens Borough President's Charter Revision Proposals<sup>249</sup>
9. Statement by Mayor Edward I. Koch, 6/28/89<sup>250</sup>
10. 1989 Adopted Expense Budget: Bronx Borough President Additions<sup>251</sup>
11. Draft Charter: "Contents"; Chapter 1 ("Mayor"; "6/28"); Chapter 2 ("Council"; "6/29/89")<sup>252</sup>
12. Draft Charter (undated)<sup>253</sup>

Expandable Folder 6 (Folders A74-A82):

1. Memorandum dated 8/23/89 from Gretchen Dykstra to NYCCRC members re: Brief Synopsis of Education Plans<sup>254</sup>
2. Memorandum dated 8/14/89 from Gretchen Dykstra to NYCCRC members re: Dissenting Report from Bernard Richland (attached)<sup>255</sup>
3. Memorandum from Eric Lane to David Hunter re: Errors, August 11, 1989 letter (attached)<sup>256</sup>
4. Letter dated 6/21/89 from New York State Comptroller Edward V. Regan to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: size of City Council<sup>257</sup>
5. Letter dated 6/23/89 from Councilman Enoch Williams to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: size of City Council and redistricting<sup>258</sup>
6. "Summary of Citizens Union Statement on New York City Charter Revision Commission / June 7, 1989"<sup>259</sup>
7. "Changes Proposed by the Chair to the Adopted Preliminary Proposals As the Result of Public Testimony and Comment / June 15, 1989"<sup>260</sup> (2 copies, second with hand annotations; see document #103)
8. "City Council Response to the June 15, 1989 Changes Proposed by the Chair of the Charter Revision Commission"<sup>261</sup> (see documents #103 and 357)
9. German Ballot with translation<sup>262</sup> (see Item 62)
10. Memorandum dated 3/28/88 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: Recommendations, with attachments<sup>263</sup>
11. Memorandum dated 4/4/88 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: Detailed Recommendations, with attachments<sup>264</sup>
12. Memorandum dated 3/17/88 from W. Bernard Richland to NYCCRC members re: weighted-vote Board of Estimate, with attachments<sup>265</sup>
13. Letter dated 3/15/88 from Stanley W. Hill and Ruth Messenger of Citizens for Charter Change to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: New York Times article<sup>266</sup>
14. Letter dated 3/16/88 from Edward N. Costikyan of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison to NYCCRC members re: preservation of the Board of Estimate<sup>267</sup> (for second copy, see document #498)
15. Letter dated 6/10/89 from Patricia Dolan of Queens Valley Home Owners' Civic Assn. to Members re: elucidate and enlarge upon previous comments<sup>268</sup>
16. Memorandum dated 5/23/88 from Gene Russianoff, Citizens for Charter Change, to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: Comments on Charter Ethics Issues to be discussed at June 3<sup>rd</sup> Commission Meeting<sup>269</sup>
17. Letter dated 3/18/88 from Edward N. Costikyan of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: preservation of the Board of Estimate<sup>270</sup> (2 copies; see document #495 et seq.)
18. Original, signed letter dated 5/11/88 from Queens Borough President Claire Shulman to David G. Trager, Commissioner re: ethics proposal, with attachment<sup>271</sup> (see document #85: identical letter to Ravitch)
19. Recommendations: Charter Revision Report (1 page)<sup>272</sup>
20. Letter dated 7/18/89 from Ralph J. Lamberti (Staten Island Borough President) and Claire Shulman (Queens Borough President) to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: concerns about Charter language regarding budget process (see also document #49)<sup>273</sup>
21. Letter dated 6/12/89 from Leon Weaver (Professor Emeritus, Michigan State University, Elections Research Project) to David G. Trager re: relative merits of representation and electoral systems built on the single-member district, with attachments<sup>274</sup> (2 copies)

22. Memorandum dated 5/18/88 from David G. Trager to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: Basic Structuring of New York City Government<sup>275</sup>
23. Memorandum dated 7/13/89 from Anthony Shorris (Commissioner of Finance) to Jeremy Travis (Special Advisor to Mayor) re: Charter Revisions with cover memorandum dated 7/17/89 from Eric Lane<sup>276</sup>
24. Memorandum dated 5/26/89 from Gene Russianoff and Joseph G. Rappaport to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: Commission on Public Information and Communication, with attachment<sup>277</sup>
25. Memorandum dated 6/26/89 from Interfaith Commission on the Landmarking of Religious Properties to NYCCRC re: "Landmarking Changes"<sup>278</sup>, with attachments including draft "Points for Charter Language"<sup>279</sup> and 49-page booklet, The Role of Amenities in the Land Use Process, reprinted from 43 The Record of the Association of the Bar of the City of New York 1 (1988)<sup>280</sup> (for photocopy, see document #597)
26. Memorandum dated 6/9/89 from Queens County Builders & Contractors Association, Inc. to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: zoning and land use provisions of revised City Charter, with attachment<sup>281</sup>
27. Original, signed letter dated 6/2/89 from Steven Sanders and Pete Grannis (Members of Assembly) to David G. Trager re: elaboration of remarks on land use review<sup>282</sup>
28. Original, signed letter dated 6/9/89 from Eugenie C. Cowan, Director of Exploring the Metropolis, Inc., to David G. Trager re: May 1989 Preliminary Proposals<sup>283</sup>
29. "Transition in Land Use" (June 27, 1989)<sup>284</sup>
30. Original, signed letter dated 5/16/88 from John Glasel, President of Local 802, Associated Musicians of Greater New York, to David G. Trager re: land-use agenda for Nov. 1988 election<sup>285</sup>
31. Original, signed letter dated 4/4/88 from Steven Spinola, President of the Real Estate Board of New York, Inc. to David G. Trager, Commissioner re: reforms of land-use related matters, with attached recommendations<sup>286</sup>
32. Memorandum dated 3/4/88 from Richard Briffault to Eric Lane re: One Person, One Vote Issues for Various Land Use Regulatory Proposals with cover memorandum dated 3/30/88 from Eric Lane<sup>287</sup>
33. Memorandum dated 7/18/89 to NYCCRC re: "The Role of the City Council in Landmark Determination and Other Related Issues"<sup>288</sup>
34. Original, signed letter dated 7/17/89 from Katherine Kennedy, Project Attorney, the Natural Resources Defense Council to David G. Trager re: June 1989 Revised Proposals<sup>289</sup>
35. Opinion No. 3-89 dated 8/1/89, on factors which can be considered in acting on designation of the Landmark Preservation Commission, addressed to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. by Corporation Counsel Peter L. Zimroth<sup>290</sup>
36. Memorandum dated 7/31/89 from The Interfaith Commission to Study the Landmarking of Religious Property to NYCCRC Members re: update on Landmark Preservation Commission's belief concerning spiritual and human services mission of religious congregations, with appendices<sup>291</sup>
37. Original, signed letter dated 8/1/89 from Landmarks Preservation Commission Chairman David F.M. Todd to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr., re: Section 25-309 of the Landmarks Law<sup>292</sup>
38. Letter dated 7/28/89 from Mayor Koch to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposals before the NYCCRC<sup>293</sup>

39. Statement dated 7/20/89 of the Puerto Rican Legal Defense and Education Fund<sup>294</sup> (see document #465)
40. Statement dated 7/18/89 of Leslie H. Lowe, member of Community Board 2<sup>295</sup> (see document #465)
41. "Recommendations of Citizens Union to the New York City Charter Revision Commission", June 1989<sup>296</sup>
42. Letter dated 5/31/88 from Brooklyn Community Board 14 to Eric Lane, Counsel and Executive Director, re: comments on draft Commission proposals<sup>297</sup>
43. Letter dated 6/1/88 from Brooklyn Community Board 14 to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: comments on draft Commission proposals<sup>298</sup>
44. "Fair Share Plan / Locating City Facilities" (2 flowcharts)<sup>299</sup>
45. Recommendations re: Charter revision from "a possible candidate for Comptroller of New York City" (Elizabeth Holtzman? n.b. pp. 8-12 only)<sup>300</sup>
46. "Materials for Commissioners": "Statement of / Donald D. Kummerfeld / Heather L. Ruth / Stanley S. Shuman / Private Members of the / New York State Financial Control Board / Submitted to the / New York City Charter Revision Commission / June 12, 1989" with introductory statements and fax cover sheet dated 6/21/89 (handwritten: "Corrected Copy")<sup>301</sup>
47. Letter dated 6/22/89 from Mayor Koch to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposal to replace Taxi and Limousine Commission<sup>302</sup>
48. Materials for NYCCRC members re: "Ballot Question" with fax cover sheet dated 8/8/89<sup>303</sup> (see also document #77)
49. Letter dated 7/18/89 from Ralph J. Lamberti (Staten Island Borough President) and Claire Shulman (Queens Borough President) to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: concerns about Charter language regarding budget process with fax cover sheet (from Nicholas G. Garaufis) dated 7/18/89<sup>304</sup> (see also document #20)
50. Letter dated 7/7/89 from Hadley W. Gold, Commissioner, Dept. of General Services to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: "ULURP Exclusion for Certain City Acquisitions" transmitted via fax [7]/27/89<sup>305</sup>
51. Draft of "Sec. XXX. Independent Budget Office"<sup>306</sup>
52. Memorandum dated 6/23/89 from Mayor Koch to NYCCRC Members re: "Borough Presidents' Role in the Budget Process" (hand notation in upper-right corner: "Call Nick Garaufis")<sup>307</sup>
53. Cover memorandum dated 3/31/88 from Ruth Lock to All Commission Members re: "corrected copy of page seven of Richard Ravitch's recommendations for the Land Management Board" (attached)<sup>308</sup>
54. Cover memorandum dated 2/2/88 from Mayor Koch to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch with attached proposals for changes in City Charter: 1) memorandum dated 1/21/88 from Sylvia Deutsch, Chairperson of the City Planning Commission to Mayor Koch; and 2) memorandum dated 1/5/88 from Paul Dickstein, Director of the New York City Office of Management and Budget to Mayor Koch<sup>309</sup>
55. Memorandum dated 6/12/89 from Terry Molloy to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: "Preliminary Proposal Modifications" (hand notation on verso of last page: "David / Just some thoughts I had--just between you me--like your comments / Terry")<sup>310</sup>
56. Memorandum dated 6/15/89 from NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. to Commission Members re: "Agenda for June 15-27 meetings"<sup>311</sup>
57. Flyer: "1989 / Public Hearings on Charter Revision"<sup>312</sup>
58. "Updated Schedule / 1989 Public Meetings And Hearings"<sup>313</sup>

59. "Agenda / June 26, 1989 Meeting"<sup>314</sup>
60. "Agenda / June 27, 1989 Meeting"<sup>315</sup>
61. "Agenda / ~~July 31~~ Aug. 1, 1989 / New York University / D'Agostino Residence Hall"<sup>316</sup>
62. "A Proposal for Broader Political Representation in an Expanded New York City Council / By David G. Trager" with German ballot and translation attached<sup>317</sup> (2 copies)
63. Memorandum dated 5/18/88 from David G. Trager to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: "Basic Structuring of New York City Government"<sup>318</sup>
64. "White/Non-White Democratic Primaries for Board of Estimate Seats": table showing minority candidates' percentage of black vote and order of finish in elections from 1961 through 1985<sup>319</sup>
65. Letter dated 5/31/89 from Mayor Koch to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposals before the NYCCRC<sup>320</sup>
66. Draft Charter language: "Reallocation of Services"<sup>321</sup>
67. List: "Reallocation of Services"<sup>322</sup>
68. Draft Charter language: "Sec. 16. Report to Council. The mayor shall submit an annual report to the council..."<sup>323</sup>
69. Draft Charter language: "In taking any action pursuant to this section, the council and the mayor may consider the historic, aesthetic, cultural and other factors relied upon by the commission as a basis for a designation..."<sup>324</sup>
70. Memorandum dated 8/15/89 from Therese M. Molloy, Commissioner re: "Objections to Charter Revision Proposals" with fax cover sheet (from Eric Lane) dated 8/23/89<sup>325</sup>
71. New York Newsday, 6/26/89, pp. 43-46 (editorial: "Reform Down to the Wire"; "Letters"; interview with former Governor Hugh Carey: "Can the City Survive—Part I"; and cartoon: Shefelman)<sup>326</sup>; archival photocopy of same
72. Draft Charter: p. 8-9<sup>327</sup>
73. Draft Charter: Chapter 35 ("Personnel Management") (n.b. hand annotations)<sup>328</sup>
74. Draft Charter: Chapter 35 ("Personnel Management"; "6/25")<sup>329</sup>
75. Memorandum dated 6/14/89 from Jeffrey D. Friedlander, City of New York Law Department re: "City Administrative Procedure Act Notice Provisions" with cover memorandum dated 6/19/89 from Eric Lane to David G. Trager and Judah Gribetz (handwritten: "Is there Index" [?])<sup>330</sup>
76. Notice re: 4/21/88 public meeting (handwritten: "~~5/4/88~~ 5/18/88")<sup>331</sup>
77. Memorandum dated 8/10/89 from Commissioner Bernard Richland re: "Ballot question" with with fax cover sheet dated 8/15/89 (see also document #48)<sup>332</sup>
78. "Brooklyn Law School Commencement Address / by Dean David G. Trager / June 13, 1989 / Avery Fisher Hall" (discusses NYCCRC)<sup>333</sup>
79. Press release dated 7/31/89: "Charter Commission Proposes 1991 Council Elections"<sup>334</sup>
80. Press release dated 8/1/89: "Charter Commission Proposes New Council Land Powers"<sup>335</sup>
81. Press release dated 8/2/89: "Charter Commission Finishes Proposals For New City Government"<sup>336</sup>
82. Photocopied clippings dated 5/31/89 through 6/16/89 from The New York Law Journal, The New York Post, and New York Newsday<sup>337</sup>
83. Draft Charter: Chapter 47 ("Access To Information"; "6/18")<sup>338</sup>
84. "Draft Changes of June 9, 1989 / G. Benjamin / Prohibiting Elected Officials From Holding Party Office"<sup>339</sup>
85. Draft Charter: pp. 8-23 through 8-24<sup>340</sup>
86. Draft Charter: Chapter 51 ("Transitory Provisions"; "6/26")<sup>341</sup>

87. "Public Notice" re: 7/13/89 public meeting<sup>342</sup>
88. New York Newsday, 6/29/89, pp. 31-32 and 121-122<sup>343</sup>; archival photocopy of two items pertaining to Charter revision on p. 31
89. Draft Charter: "Chapter \_\_\_" ("New York City Equal Employment Practices Commission")<sup>344</sup>
90. Draft Charter: Chapter 2-A ("Districting Commission"; "6/26/89 9:00 PM (15)")<sup>345</sup>
91. Draft Charter: Chapter 47 ("Public Access To Meetings And Information"; "6/26")<sup>346</sup> (2 copies)
92. Draft Charter: Chapter 14 ("Franchises, Revocable Consents And Concessions"; "Draft 6/26/89")<sup>347</sup>
93. Draft Charter: Chapter 13-A ("Office Of Financial And Economic Opportunity"; "Draft VIII - June 26, 1989")<sup>348</sup>
94. Draft Charter: Chapter 13-B ("Office Of Labor Services"; "June 27, 1989")<sup>349</sup>
95. Memorandum dated 7/10/89 from Ruth Messinger and Stanley W. Hill to Concerned Citizens and Groups re: NYCCRC hearings<sup>350</sup>
96. Letter dated 7/27/89 from Bronx Borough President Fernando Ferrer to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. and NYCCRC members re: clarification and expanded commentary on testimony; second copy with fax cover sheet (from Ferrer to David G. Trager)<sup>351</sup>
97. "Land Use Decisions" (Comparison of Board of Estimate and Proposed Charter)<sup>352</sup> (2 copies)
98. Statement submitted 7/28/89 by Marcy Benstock, Executive Director of NYC Clean Air Campaign, Inc.<sup>353</sup>
99. "Board of Estimate Review Where the City Planning Commission Fails to Act"; dated 7/31/89<sup>354</sup>
100. Memorandum dated 8/1/89 from Sylvia Deutsch to Chair and Members re: ULURP applications, with attached memorandum to her from Lance I. Michaels dated 7/31/89 re: "Rates of Certification/ Duration of Pre-Certification Period"<sup>355</sup>
101. Letter dated 7/25/89 from Willa Appel, Executive Director of Citizens Housing and Planning Council to Mr. Frederick A.O. Schwarz re: problems in Commission's proposals<sup>356</sup>
102. "Addendum To City Council Response To The June 15, 1989 Changes Proposed By The Chair Of The Charter Revision Commission" dated 6/20/89 (see document #261)<sup>357</sup>
103. Original, signed letter dated 6/20/89 from Mitchell S. Bernard and Katherine Kennedy of the Natural Resources Defense Council to David G. Trager re: May 1989 Preliminary Proposals<sup>358</sup>
104. Transcript of Testimony / Brooklyn Public Hearing / April 23, 1987<sup>359</sup>

Expandable Folder 4 (Folder A83):

1. Cover memorandum from Eric Lane dated 9/12/88 to Members re: "Public Hearings, June 27-30, 1988"<sup>360</sup>; "Index to The Public Hearing Transcripts"<sup>361</sup>; [volume 1:] Transcript of Testimony / Staten Island Public Hearing / June 27, 1988<sup>362</sup>; [volume 2:] Transcript of Testimony / Bronx Public Hearing / June 28, 1988<sup>363</sup>; [volume 3:] Transcript of Testimony / Queens Public Hearing / June 29, 1988<sup>364</sup> (2 copies); [volume 4:] Transcript of Testimony / Brooklyn Public Hearing / June 30, 1989<sup>365</sup>; [volume 5:] Transcript of Testimony / Manhattan Public Hearing / June 30, 1989<sup>366</sup> (2 copies)
2. Summary of and Comments on Initial Proposals and Index to the Public Hearing Transcripts / June 27-30, 1988<sup>367</sup>; n.b. broken at spine; needs rebinding
3. Final Report of the New York City Charter Revision Commission / January 1989-November 1989, March 1990<sup>368</sup>

**Formerly Housed In Boxes Acquired In September 2014**

Folder A84:

1. "The Association Of The Bar Of The City Of New York / Committee On Municipal Affairs / New York City Charter Revision Principles"<sup>369</sup>
2. Memorandum dated 9/23/87 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: "Schedule of Activities" (n.b. inscription to David G. Trager and other hand annotations), with the following attachments: "Appendix A / Commission Activities To Date", "Appendix B / Planned Commission Events", and "Appendix C / City Government Events Of Interest"<sup>370</sup>
3. Original, signed letter dated 12/1/87 from Richard Ravitch to David G. Trager re: scheduling (n.b. hand annotations)<sup>371</sup>
4. Memorandum dated 12/12/87 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: "January Schedule" (n.b. hand annotations)<sup>372</sup>
5. Original, signed cover letter dated 12/21/87 from Staten Island Borough President Ralph J. Lamberti<sup>373</sup>; An Inquiry Into Self-Determination // Staten Island // A Report To Borough President Ralph J. Lamberti From The Staten Island Committee For The Review Of Secession // December 14, 1987<sup>374</sup>
6. Original, signed cover letter dated 1/14/88 from Community Board 6 Chair Michael G. Yamin<sup>375</sup>; Appendix C: resolution dated 12/9/87<sup>376</sup>; Appendix D: resolution dated 7/15/87<sup>377</sup>; Statement dated 6/1/87<sup>378</sup>

Folder A85:

1. New York Media Review: February 1988, Vol. 1, No. 1<sup>379</sup>

Folder A86:

1. Letter dated 2/1/88 from Brooklyn Botanic Garden President Donald E. Moore to NYCCRC Chairperson Richard Ravitch re: role of borough presidents and Board of Estimate in budget process (n.b. "David— I hope this / will have your attention / Don" and other hand annotations)<sup>380</sup>
2. Memorandum dated 2/1/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: "Schedule For February, 1988"<sup>381</sup>
3. Cover letter dated 2/1/88 from Gretchen Dykstra<sup>382</sup>; color poster: "The New York City Charter" (©1988; folded)<sup>383</sup>
4. The Voter's Guidebook (ca. 1988)<sup>384</sup>
5. Color poster: "The Proposed New York City Charter" (ca. 1989; folded)<sup>385</sup>
6. Memorandum dated 2/4/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: "New Address"<sup>386</sup>
7. Memorandum dated 2/9/88 from Gretchen Dykstra to NYCCRC members re: "Summary and update on communications strategy and activities"<sup>387</sup>
8. Original, signed letter dated 2/16/88 from Brooklyn Academy of Music Chairman Asher B. Edelman to David G. Trager re: role of borough presidents and Board of Estimate in budget process (n.b. Post-It note: "Response")<sup>388</sup>
9. Cover memorandum dated 2/17/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members (n.b. enclosures missing)<sup>389</sup>
10. Letter dated 2/18/88 from Brooklyn Borough President Howard Golden to Paul Dickstein re: budget reductions for NYC cultural institutions<sup>390</sup>
11. Cover memorandum dated 2/24/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members<sup>391</sup>; Atlas of the Census: A Portrait of New York City From the 1980 Census (Department of City Planning, 5/85), accompanied by 6 transparencies ("New York City Borough Overlay" and "Community District Overlay" for each of the 5 boroughs)<sup>392</sup>



12. Cover memorandum dated 3/7/88 from Muriel Greenhill of Environmentors and Anthony Vera of American Lung Association of Brooklyn to NYCCRC members<sup>393</sup>; The New York City Citizens' Environmental Complaint Process: A Municipal Disgrace (12/87; bound in report cover)<sup>394</sup>

Folder A87:

1. Cover memorandum dated 3/9/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members: "I enclose for your information suggested Charter changes received from Mayor Koch."<sup>395</sup>; letter dated 12/8/87 from Mayor Koch to Richard Ravitch with attached first group of memoranda from NYC agency heads<sup>396</sup>; letter dated 12/16/87 from Mayor Koch to Richard Ravitch with attached second group of memoranda from NYC agency heads<sup>397</sup>
2. "Borough Representation // Lenore Chester, Writer/Researcher / Assisted by / Vance Benguiat, Jeannette Kahlenberg, Elva Woodard // Paper prepared for the New York City Charter Revision Commission / by Citizens Union Foundation of the City of New York / [...] / April 88"<sup>398</sup>; "Executive Summary"<sup>399</sup> (excerpt from document #398)
3. Photocopied clipping: Carl Campanile, "Legislature May Yet Have Say In City Charter Revision", Staten Island Advance, 4/3/88, p. B4<sup>400</sup>
4. Directions to restrooms etc. for attendees of 4/14/88 meeting at New York Society for Ethical Culture<sup>401</sup>
5. List dated 4/14/88 of seven "Recommended Subjects For November 1988 Ballot"<sup>402</sup> (see document #407)
6. "Public Notice" of 5/9/88 meeting to be held at New York University School of Law (2 copies, 1 annotated)<sup>403</sup>; directions to restrooms etc. for attendees<sup>404</sup>
7. Memorandum dated 6/3/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: "November 1988 Ballot Proposals"<sup>405</sup> (see documents #64A-64C and 64F)
8. Directions to restrooms etc. for attendees of 6/3/88 meeting at Association of the Bar of the City of New York<sup>406</sup> (see documents #35-57)
9. Letter dated 6/10/88 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to Alvin M. Berk and Helen D. Henkin re: recommended ballot items for 11/88 election<sup>407</sup> (see document #402)
10. "Proposed Public Hearings Schedule": 6/27-6/30[/88]<sup>408</sup>
11. Cover memorandum dated 7/15/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Additional Testimony"<sup>409</sup> (see document #62)
12. "Public Notice" of 7/26/88 meeting to be held at the Association of the Bar of the City of New York<sup>410</sup>
13. Letter dated 7/28/88 from George A. Davidson and William Josephson of the Association of the Bar of the City of New York to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: Committee on Municipal Affairs's comments on "proposals with respect to special elections, mayoral inability and administrative procedures"<sup>411</sup>
14. Cover memorandum dated 8/4/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Drafts of Commission Proposals" concerning 5 topics<sup>412</sup> (n.b. missing)
15. Cover memorandum dated 8/5/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Drafts of Commission Proposals" concerning 3 topics<sup>413</sup> (n.b. missing)
16. Cover memorandum dated 8/5/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Additional Testimony"<sup>414</sup> (see document #62)
17. Cover letter dated 9/20/88 from Eric Lane; "September 20, 1988 / Charter Ballot Questions"<sup>415</sup> (see documents #64A-64C, 64F, and 402-407)

18. Letter dated 9/21/88 from City Clerk Carlos Cuevas to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: responsibilities of the City Clerk<sup>416</sup>

Folder A88:

1. Letter dated 1/13/89 from Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. to NYCCRC members re: "Short-term schedule of activities"<sup>417</sup>
2. Cover memorandum dated 2/14/89 from Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. to NYCCRC members re: "Outline Summaries" (n.b. hand annotations)<sup>418</sup>; "as of 2/11/89 / Local Voice in Government / February 28, 1989"<sup>419</sup>; "as of 2/11/89 / Contracting and Procurement / March 1, 1989"<sup>420</sup>; "as of 2/11/89 / Land Use Decisionmaking / March 2, 1989"<sup>421</sup>; "as of 2/13/89 / Oversight and Representation / March 9, 1989"<sup>422</sup>; "as of 2/14/89 / Franchising / March 14, 1989"<sup>423</sup>; "as of 2/13/89 / Budgeting / March 15, 1989"<sup>424</sup>
3. "Schedule Necessary to Place Charter Proposals on the November Ballot" [1989]<sup>425</sup>
4. "Borough Presidents": outline of proposals [1989] (n.b. hand annotations)<sup>426</sup>
5. Letter dated 4/18/89 from Bronx Borough President Fernando Ferrer to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: highlights and revisions of his Charter reform proposal<sup>427</sup>
6. Letter dated 4/17/89 from Park Slope Fifth Avenue Local Development Corporation President Albert Cabbad and Executive Director David Brickman to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: role of borough presidents and Board of Estimate in budget process<sup>428</sup> (2 copies)
7. Letter dated 4/18/89 from Kensington-Windsor Terrace Neighborhood Housing Services Executive Director Louise Paglen to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: role of borough presidents in budget process<sup>429</sup> (2 copies)
8. Letter dated 4/18/89 from Society for the Preservation of Weeksville and Bedford-Stuyvesant History Executive Director Joan Maynard to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: role of borough presidents and Board of Estimate in budget process<sup>430</sup> (2 copies)
9. Letter dated 4/20/89 from East Williamsburg Valley Industrial Development Corporation Director of Economic Development Michael F. Rochford to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: role of borough presidents and Board of Estimate in budget process<sup>431</sup> (2 copies)
10. Letter dated 4/20/89 from Prospect Park Alliance Executive Director Pam Fishman to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: role of borough presidents and Board of Estimate in budget process<sup>432</sup> (2 copies)
11. Letter dated 4/20/89 from The Brooklyn Children's Museum Director Mindy Duitz to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: role of borough presidents and Board of Estimate in budget process<sup>433</sup> (2 copies)
12. Letter dated 5/1/89 from Bronx Council on the Arts founder Irma L. Fleck to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: role of borough presidents and Board of Estimate in budget process<sup>434</sup>
13. Letter dated 5/2/89 from Brooklyn Borough President Howard Golden to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: public meetings between NYCCRC and commissioners of NYC agencies<sup>435</sup>
14. Cover memorandum dated 5/3/89 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Relevant Recommendations on Charter Revision"<sup>436</sup>; letter dated 4/7/89 from Queens Valley Home Owners' Civic Association President Patricia Dolan to NYCCRC<sup>437</sup>; letters dated 4/19/89<sup>438</sup> and 5/2/89<sup>439</sup> from Simeon H.F. Goldstein to NYCCRC; letter dated 5/4/89 from Chinatown

- Voter Education Alliance Vice-President Gail Kong and Treasurer Larry Lee to NYCCRC, accompanied by 7-page statement<sup>440</sup>
15. "Agenda" for 5/10/89 meeting<sup>441</sup> (2 copies)

Folder A89:

1. Cover memorandum dated 5/12/89 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Enclosed documents"<sup>442</sup>
2. Agenda for May 13, 1989 meeting<sup>443</sup> (2 copies);
3. Regarding fiscal impact statements: A provision of Maryland State law requiring fiscal impact notes on state legislation[;] The New York State law requiring fiscal notes to accompany pension bills<sup>444</sup>;
4. Regarding tax benefit analysis: The California State law requiring an annual report on tax expenditures[;] The Maine State law requiring legislative review of property tax exemptions[;] The Michigan State law requiring a tax expenditures report as an appendix to the executive budget, and an excerpt of the most recent report prepared pursuant to this provision<sup>445</sup>;
5. City Council President proposal<sup>446</sup>;
6. Regarding the Vice Mayor: Testimony of Councilmember Hilton B. Clark at April 4, 1989 Commission hearing[;] Slating by Gerald Benjamin [see document #572 (double-sided copy)]; Excerpt from The Number of Citywide Elected Officials, by Gerald Benjamin[;] Excerpt from The Selection and Role of the Council President, by Gerald Benjamin[;] Memorandum on Succession in the Largest Cities[; and] The Vice[-]Mayor Concept, by Nat Cipollina<sup>447</sup>;
7. Regarding the Comptroller: Summaries of Comptroller Goldin's proposals in spring of 1987 and 1989[;] Testimony by Comptroller Goldin at April 6, 1989 Commission hearing[;] April 18, 1989 letter from Assemblyman [Mark Alan] Siegel[; and] Talking points of Assemblyman Siegel from April 6, 1989 hearing<sup>448</sup>
8. ['Alterbudget Response / 5/8/89 / to / The Commission's Recommendations / on / Borough Presidents / 5/6/89'] from the City Project<sup>449</sup>

Folder A90:

1. Letter dated 5/30/89 from Kevin Ranaghan and Maria A. Thomson of the Woodhaven Residents' Block Association to David G. Trager re: role of borough presidents in budget process<sup>450</sup>
2. Letter dated 6/2/89 from Jewish Community Council of Pelham Parkway Executive Director David Edelstein to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: role of borough presidents and Board of Estimate in budget process, with attached copy of editorial from The Riverdale Press, 5/18/89<sup>451</sup>
3. Original, signed letter dated 6/5/89 from Thalia Spanish Theatre Administrative Director Kathryn Giaimo to David G. Trager re: role of borough presidents in budget process<sup>452</sup>
4. "Testimony Of Richard D. Emery / New York Charter Revision Committee [sic] / Tuesday, June 6, 1989"<sup>453</sup>
5. Original, signed letter dated 6/8/89 from Colden Center for the Performing Arts Acting Executive Director Vivian Charlop to NYCCRC Commissioner Patrick J. Murphy re: role of borough presidents in budget process<sup>454</sup>

6. Letter dated 6/9/89 from Queens Council on the Arts Executive Director Constance Evans to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. and NYCCRC members re: role of borough presidents in budget process<sup>455</sup>
7. Citizens Union Reports: summer 1989<sup>456</sup>
8. Original, signed letter dated 7/3/89 from St. John's Episcopal Hospital South Shore Administrator Bruce B. Davidow to David G. Trager re: role of borough presidents in budget process<sup>457</sup>
9. "Recommendations of Citizens Union to the New York City Charter Revision Commission" dated 7/20/89<sup>458</sup>
10. Draft memorandum dated 7/27/89 from NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. to NYCCRC members re: "Thoughts re the Forthcoming Hearing" transmitted 7/28/89 with fax cover sheet (from Schwarz to David G. Trager)<sup>459</sup>
11. "Public Notice" re: 8/11/89 submission of NYCCRC's proposed Charter revisions to U.S. Justice Department (verso, Spanish translation), with attached list of public libraries where "Copies of the entire submission" may be examined<sup>460</sup>
12. Cover letter dated 9/15/89 from Brooklyn Borough President Howard Golden to NYCCRC member David G. Trager re: "enclosed [...] copy of my submission to the United States Department of Justice asking that the proposals submitted by the New York City Charter Revision Commission be rejected"<sup>461</sup>; letter dated 9/6/89 from Golden to U.S. Department of Justice Civil Rights Division Acting Chief Barry H. Weinberg, with several attachments<sup>462</sup>

#### Folder A91:

1. Cover "Notice" from NYCCRC re: "documents, sent to the Justice Department by the Charter Revision Commission, in response to objections filed with the Justice Department"<sup>463</sup>
2. Letter dated 9/28/89 from NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. and Counsel/Executive Director Eric Lane to U.S. Department of Justice Civil Rights Division Acting Chief Barry H. Weinberg re: "Comments on Objections Regarding the Process of the New York City Charter Revision Commission" bound with several exhibits<sup>464</sup>

#### Binder A2:

1. Table of contents; letter dated 9/29/89 from NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. and Counsel/Executive Director Eric Lane to U.S. Department of Justice Civil Rights Division Acting Chief Barry H. Weinberg re: "Comments on Objections to Proposed Amendments to the New York City Charter" with the following attachments: "1 - 'In New York Real Estate Market, Buy or Build?' from the New York Observer, September 25, 1989"; "2 - Board of Estimate Votes: 1985 to 1987"; "3 - August 23, 1989 Letter from Queens Borough President Claire Shulman"; "4 - Response to Objections Regarding Budgeting and Procurement Proposals"; "5 - Response to Objections to Land Use Proposals Filed by Puerto Rican Legal Defense and Education Fund, Inc. and by Leslie H. Lowe, Esq."<sup>465</sup> (see documents #294-295)

#### Folder A92:

1. "New York City / 1989 / Staten Island / Voter / Guide / General Election / Tuesday, November 7" (1989)<sup>466</sup>
2. Original, initialed cover note from Mayor's Task Force On Charter Implementation Chair Eric Lane dated 10/4/90 (n.b. attached Post-It note: "Dorothy Li / For Charter / Revision")<sup>467</sup>
3. Letter dated 9/28/90 from Lane to Mayor Dinkins re: fulfillment of Task Force's task<sup>468</sup>, accompanied by "Charter Implementation Timetable" dated 9/28/90<sup>469</sup>

Folder A93:

1. VHS Video Tape: *Bringing the Constitution Home: The Challenge of Charter Revision*, New York City Charter Revision Commission, Fall 1987

**SUB-GROUP B: VOTING RIGHTS (1987-1989)**

Folder B1:

1. Cover memorandum dated 11/16/87 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Proposal Submitted By Congressman Major Owens"<sup>470</sup>; "Proposals For The Revision Of The New York City Charter: Statement of Congressman Major Owens-President of the Coalition for Community Empowerment"<sup>471</sup>
2. "Supplementary Material Related To Weighted Voting Submitted By Manhattan Borough President David N. Dinkins To The Commission On Charter Revision January 14, 1988" (n.b. Post-It note: "NYC official response")<sup>472</sup>

Folders B2-B3:

1. Cover memorandum dated 2/1/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members: "I enclose a notebook containing the following Voting Rights materials"<sup>473</sup>:
2. Photocopy of 42 USC § 1973<sup>474</sup>;
3. Photocopy of 28 CFR § 51<sup>475</sup>;
4. Letter dated 1/14/88 from Eric Lane to Prof. M. David Gelfand of Tulane University Law School soliciting his advice<sup>476</sup>;
5. "Executive Summary / Memorandum of January 27, 1988 / from M. David Gelfand and Terry E. Allbritton / to Richard Ravitch"<sup>477</sup> (2 copies, the first not included in original notebook);
6. Memorandum dated 1/27/88 from M. David Gelfand and Terry E. Allbritton to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: "Voting Rights Aspects of the Structure of the New York City Board of Estimate"<sup>478</sup> (2 copies, the second not included in original notebook);
7. Curriculum vitae of Prof. Gelfand<sup>479</sup>;
8. "An Evaluation Of Whether A Weighted Voting System For The Board Of Estimate Would Comply With Section 5 Of The Voting Rights Act (A Memorandum Prepared for Richard Ravitch, Chairman, New York City Charter Revision Commission) by Katharine I. Butler / Febraury 3, 1988"<sup>480</sup>;
9. Cover memorandum dated 2/8/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members: "Enclosed please find those exhibits to Katharine Butler's memorandum which were missing from last week's mailing, along with an errata sheet."<sup>481</sup> (n.b. not included in original notebook);
10. Amended "Exhibit A"<sup>482</sup> (n.b. not included in original notebook);
11. "Errata, Butler Memo"<sup>483</sup> (n.b. not included in original notebook); photocopy of Katharine Inglis Butler,
12. "Reapportionment, the Courts, and the Voting Rights Act: A Resegregation Of the Political Process?," 56 University of Colorado Law Review 1 (1984)<sup>484</sup>;
13. Curriculum vitae of Prof. Butler<sup>485</sup>

Folder B4:

1. Letter dated 2/4/88 from New York City Comptroller Harrison J. Goldin, City Council President Andrew J. Stein, Manhattan Borough President David N. Dinkins, Brooklyn Borough President Howard Golden, Bronx Borough President Fernando Ferrer, Queens Borough President Claire

- Shulman, and Staten Island Borough President Ralph J. Lamberti to NYCCRC re: voting rights and the Board of Estimate<sup>486</sup>
2. Letter dated 2/11/88 from Edward N. Costikyan of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: preservation of the Board of Estimate<sup>487</sup>
  3. Original, signed letter dated 2/29/88 from Manhattan Borough President David N. Dinkins to David G. Trager re: "the minority community's concerns with possible reduction in executive powers now exercised by the Board of Estimate"<sup>488</sup>; press release dated 2/29/88 from the office of the Manhattan Borough President, with attached "Statement By Manhattan Borough President David Dinkins, Congressman Charles Rangel And Former Congressman Herman Badillo On Charter Revision And Minority Representation" dated 2/29/88<sup>489</sup>
  4. Cover memorandum dated 3/9/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Voting Rights Act"<sup>490</sup>; cover letter dated 3/8/88 from New York University School of Law Dean Norman Redlich<sup>491</sup>; memorandum dated 3/7/88 from Dean Redlich and Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law Voting Rights Project Director Frank R. Parker re: "Legal Evaluation of Proposed Structural Changes in New York City Board of Estimate" (n.b. hand annotation)<sup>492</sup>; cover letter dated 3/4/88 from Arlin M. Adams of Schnader, Harrison, Segal & Lewis to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch<sup>493</sup>; memorandum from Adams to Ravitch re: "Application of the Voting Rights Act of 1965 to a Weighted Voting Plan for New York's Board of Estimate"<sup>494</sup>
  5. Letter dated 3/22/88 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to Edward N. Costikyan re: Voting Rights Act<sup>495</sup> (see document #270)
  6. Letter dated 3/23/88 from Edward N. Costikyan of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: Voting Rights Act<sup>496</sup>
  7. Original, signed letter dated 3/23/88 from City Council [Legislative Panel on Charter Revision] Vice Chairman Peter F. Vallone to David G. Trager re: 3/16/88 letter from Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison<sup>497</sup>; copy of 3/16/88 letter<sup>498</sup> (see document #267); contract dated 2/25/88 between the Board of Estimate and Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison<sup>499</sup>
  8. Press release dated 3/23/88 from the City Council Office of Public Information, with attached letter dated 3/22/88 from Mayor Koch to Edward N. Costikyan of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison re: language perceived as offensive in 3/16/88 letter<sup>500</sup> (2 copies)

Folder B5:

1. Photocopy of handwritten analysis of the effect of weighted voting upon the Board of Estimate, with handwritten additions<sup>501</sup>; attached tables showing racial and ethnic breakdown of populations of the five boroughs of New York City, with handwritten additions<sup>502</sup>
2. 59 tables (prepared by Frank J. Mauro?) analyzing various schemes for weighted voting, including those proposed by Staten Island Borough President Ralph J. Lamberti, NYCCRC member W. Bernard Richland, Bronx Borough President Fernando Ferrer, and Manhattan Borough President David N. Dinkins (n.b. hand annotations)<sup>503</sup>
3. Photocopies from reporter: Franklin v. Krause, 32 N.Y.2d 234 (1973)<sup>504</sup>; Iannucci v. Board of Supervisors, 20 N.Y.2d 244 (1967)<sup>505</sup>
4. 5 maps "Prepared For The New York City Charter Revision Commission": "Bronx County / 1984 Congressional Districts"; "Kings County / 1984 Congressional Districts"; "New York County / 1984 Congressional Districts"; "Queens County / 1984 Congressional Districts"; "Richmond County / 1984 Congressional Districts"<sup>506</sup>

Folder B6:

1. Original, signed letter dated 3/24/88 from Manhattan Borough President David N. Dinkins to David G. Trager re: weighted voting, with attached tables<sup>507</sup>
2. Letter dated 3/24/88 from W. Bernard Richland to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: Voting Rights Act<sup>508</sup>
3. Memorandum dated 3/25/88 from Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison to the NYCCRC re: "The Voting Rights Act's Problem Incident To Restructuring the Board of Estimate"<sup>509</sup>
4. Letter dated 3/28/88 from Staten Island Borough President Ralph J. Lamberti to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: proposed abolition of the Board of Estimate<sup>510</sup>
5. Memorandum dated 3/31/88 from Manhattan Borough President David N. Dinkins to the NYCCRC re: weighted voting, with attached tables<sup>511</sup>

Folder B7:

1. Cover letter dated 4/18/88 from Edward N. Costikyan of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch<sup>512</sup>; order issued in Herbert M. Collins, et al. v. City of Norfolk, et al., 83 Civ. 526-N (E.D. Va. 1988)<sup>513</sup>
2. Handwritten cover memorandum dated 4/19/88 from Frank Mauro to David G. Trager<sup>514</sup>; photocopied excerpt from Martin Harrop and William L. Miller, Elections and Voters: A Comparative Introduction (MacMillan Education, 1987)<sup>515</sup>
3. Cover memorandum dated 4/25/88 from Prof. Neil B. Cohen of Brooklyn Law School to David G. Trager<sup>516</sup>; printout of Robert A. Pollak and Douglas H. Blair, "Rational Collective Choice," 249 Scientific American 88 (August 1983)<sup>517</sup>
4. Cover letter dated 5/20/88 from Edward N. Costikyan of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch<sup>518</sup>; cover letter dated 4/15/88 from Prof. Henry Paul Monaghan of Columbia University School of Law to Costikyan<sup>519</sup>; letter dated 4/14/88 from Monaghan to Costikyan re: "my opinion with respect to the impact of the Voting Rights Act on various plans for restructuring the Board of Estimate"<sup>520</sup>
5. Cover letter dated 6/16/88 from Edward N. Costikyan of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch<sup>521</sup>; letter dated 6/2/88 from Prof. Gary J. Simson of Cornell Law School to Ravitch re: weighted voting proposal for the Board of Estimate in light of the Voting Rights Act<sup>522</sup>
6. Cover letter dated 7/12/88 from Edward N. Costikyan of Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch<sup>523</sup>; memorandum dated 6/29/88 from Prof. Michel Rosenfeld of the New York Law School to NYCCRC re: "Validity of Weighted Voting Plan for the New York City Board of Estimate Under the 1965 Voting Rights Act"<sup>524</sup>

Folder B8:

1. "Filling Vacancies / In / The Council And Borough Presidencies // Prepared For The New York City Charter Revision Commission / By / Gerald Benjamin"<sup>525</sup>
2. Cover sheet: "Vacancies And Special Elections" with attached draft Charter sections corresponding to each of three options: "Approval Voting"; "Open Primary and Run-Off Election, If Necessary"; and "Party Nomination"<sup>526</sup>
3. "Approval Voting // Prepared by Douglas Muzzio / with the assistance of the Charter Revision Commission Staff"<sup>527</sup>
4. "Approval Voting For New York City / Steven J. Brams"<sup>528</sup>; photocopied clipping: Steven J. Brams, "Vote Early and Often", New York Newsday, 3/26/88, p. 50<sup>529</sup>; photocopied excerpt from Steven J. Brams and Peter C. Fishburn, Approval Voting (Birkhäuser, 1982)<sup>530</sup>

5. Draft Charter chapter<sup>531</sup> (“Voter Assistance”; “June 1, 1988”; handwritten: “corrected version”; see document #53)
6. Letter dated 8/88 from New York City Board of Elections President Ferdinand C. Marchi and Executive Director Betty Dolen to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: voter assistance<sup>532</sup>
7. Draft Charter: Chapter 46 (“Elections And Voter Assistance”; “August 3, 1988”)<sup>533</sup>
8. Memorandum dated 5/1/89 from David G. Trager to NYCCRC members re: “Borough Representation in City Council”<sup>534</sup>; memorandum dated 5/1/89 from David G. Trager to NYCCRC members re: “Borough Representation in City Legislature”<sup>535</sup>
9. Letter dated 5/5/89 from City Councilman Enoch Williams to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: “minority representation in City government”<sup>536</sup>
10. Letter dated 5/16/89 from Institute for Puerto Rican Policy President Angelo Falcon to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr.<sup>537</sup>; “Charter Revision And Racial Exclusion / The 1988 Charter Vote In New York City // A Report / of the / New York City Project // May 1989”<sup>538</sup>
11. Letter dated 6/7/89 from Institute for Puerto Rican Policy President Angelo Falcon to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: Schwarz’s response dated 5/23/89 to foregoing report<sup>539</sup>
12. Letter dated 6/25/89 from Association of Puerto Rican Executive Directors Executive Director Elizabeth Colon to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr.<sup>540</sup>; “Association of Puerto Rican / Executive Directors / Charter Revision / Review & Recommendations / June, 1989”<sup>541</sup>
13. Letter dated 7/21/89 from Lester Pollack, Michael S. Miller, Robert O. Lehrman, and Martin S. Begun to NYCCRC Commissioner Judah Gribetz re: redistricting and voting rights, with attached “New York City Charter Revision: Council Districting Commission / Discussion Notes” and fax cover sheet (from Gribetz to David G. Trager) dated 7/25/89<sup>542</sup>

#### **SUB-GROUP C: MAYORAL INABILITY (1988)**

##### Folder C1:

1. Cover memorandum dated 2/17/88 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: “Materials For February 25 Meeting”<sup>543</sup> (See Binder C)

##### Binder C:

1. Table of contents; “1. Mayoral Inability and Absence: Options outline”; “2. Twenty-fifth Amendment to the U.S. Constitution (Appendix A)”; “3. Governor’s Program Bill (in relation to gubernatorial inability and succession) (Appendix B)”; “4. Chart: Comparison of 25th amendment and Governor’s Program Bill”; “5. Report: N.Y.S. Law Revision Commission, 1987. (Back[g]round Report to Governor’s Program Bill)”; “6. Report: The Proposed Twenty-fifth Amendment to the Constitution, John D. [Feerick]. Reprinted in Selected Materials on the Twenty-fifth Amendment, U.S. printing office: 1973”; “7. Report: The [White Burkett] Miller Center [of Public Affairs] Commission [on] Presidential Disability and the Twenty-fifth Amendment and staff summary of the report”<sup>544</sup> (see document #59)

##### Folder C2:

1. Letter dated 5/5/88 from Eric Lane to Judah Gribetz re: mayoral disability<sup>545</sup>
2. Cover sheet dated 5/20/88; press release dated 5/19/88 from NYCCRC: “Charter Commission Adopts Special Election, Mayoral Disability Proposals”<sup>546</sup> (2 copies)
3. Outline: “Options For Declaration Of Mayoral Inability”<sup>547</sup>
4. Outline: “Mayoral Inability”<sup>548</sup>



5. Chart: "Comparison Of 25th Amendment, Governor's Program Bill And Ravitch Proposal"<sup>549</sup>
6. Draft Charter: Section 10 ("Mayoral Inability")<sup>550</sup>
7. Draft Charter: Section 10 ("Mayoral Inability"; "August 3, 1988")<sup>551</sup>

**SUB-GROUP D: THE CITY COUNCIL (1987-1989)**

Folder D1:

1. Cover memorandum dated 10/26/87 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Materials On City Council"<sup>552</sup>: outline: "The City Council"<sup>553</sup>;
2. Chart comparing laws governing City Council in New York, in Seattle, as proposed by Sanders, and as proposed by Sovern<sup>554</sup>;
3. 8 tables showing the projected results of expanding the City Council in accordance with 8 different proposals<sup>555</sup>;
4. "Options For Election Reform / In New York City / Report To The New York City / Charter Revision Commission // Prepared by / Herbert E. Alexander / [...] // October 15, 1987 // Herbert E. Alexander, Inc."<sup>556</sup>;
5. Outline: "Campaign Financing: Issues Raised In H. Alexander Paper"<sup>557</sup>
6. "A New Spirit / A New Council / A New Year // State of the City Council Address // Peter F. Vallone / [...] / January 6, 1988"<sup>558</sup>
7. Cover memorandum dated 2/17/88 from Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members<sup>559</sup>;
8. "The Size of the City Council // Prepared For the Commission By / Gerald Benjamin / Douglas Muzzio / Tim Tompkins"<sup>560</sup> (n.b. nearly identical to document #561);
9. "The Size of the City Council // Prepared for the New York City Charter Revision Commission / by / Gerald Benjamin and Douglas Muzzio"<sup>561</sup> (n.b. nearly identical to document #560)

Folder D2:

1. Memorandum dated 4/26/88 from Frank J. Mauro to NYCCRC members re: "Vacancies in the Council Presidency" with attachments<sup>562</sup>
2. Draft Charter: Chapter 2 ("Council"; "8/5 5:30pm")<sup>563</sup>

Folder D3:

1. Cover memorandum dated 5/3/89 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Enclosed Documents"<sup>564</sup>:
  - a. "Agenda [for 5/6/89 meeting]"<sup>565</sup>;
  - b. "Sovern Commission memo on floterial districts"<sup>566</sup>;
  - c. "A book containing the latest proposals from the Borough Presidents, Councilwoman Ruth Messinger; and last year[’s] proposals from Richard Ravitch and Dean Trager" (n.b. missing);
  - d. "3 charts summarizing the above proposals with respect to land use, budgeting and contracting"<sup>567-569</sup>;
  - e. "Papers prepared for the Commission by Gerald Benjamin on the following topics: The Size of the City Council [(with Doug Muzzio: ‘An Excerpt From The Election, Organization And Operation Of The City Council’)<sup>570</sup>];
  - f. The Selection and Role of the City Council President<sup>571</sup>[; and] Slating<sup>572</sup>" (see document #447, which includes single-sided copy);
  - g. Memorandum dated 5/2/89 from Richard Briffault to Eric Lane re: "The One Person, One Vote Doctrine and an Appointive Land Use Board"<sup>573</sup>

2. Cover memorandum dated 5/5/89 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: “Enclosed Documents”<sup>574</sup>:
  - a. “Memo from Frank Mauro on District Size and Minority Representation”<sup>575</sup>;
  - b. “Memo [dated 5/4/89] from Frank Mauro on One Person, One Vote Aspects of Proposal to Include Borough Presidents in City Council”<sup>576</sup>;
  - c. “Andrews v. Koch decision and order [dated 11/17/81]”<sup>577</sup>;
  - d. “Summary of Proposals for Powers of the Borough Presidents”<sup>578</sup>;
  - e. “Options for oversight role of the council President”<sup>579</sup>;
  - f. “May 3, 1989 letter from [City Council Chair, Legislative Panel on Charter Revision Hilton Clark and Vice Chairman and] Majority Leader Peter Vallone”<sup>580</sup> (2 copies)

Folder D4:

1. Cover memorandum dated 5/9/89 from Frank J. Mauro to NYCCRC members re: “The Role of the President of the Council/Ombudsman” with the following attachments: “Ombudsman Standards (per United States Association of Ombudsmen)”; “Current Charter Provisions on the Ombudsman/ Oversight Roles of the City Council President”; “Options for the City Council President”; “Chapter 96, Statutes of the State of Hawaii, establishing an Office of the Ombudsman”; “Auditing Standards of the United States General Accounting Office”; “Fact Sheet on the Swedish Ombudsman”; “Selections from the Annual Report of the Ombudsman from: Hawaii[,] Colorado[,] Alaska[, and] Minnesota”<sup>581</sup>

**SUB-GROUP E: LOCAL VOICE IN GOVERNMENT (1988-1989)**

Binder E1:

1. Cover memorandum dated 9/27/88 from Frank J. Mauro to NYCCRC members re: “Community Governance and Decentralization of Service Delivery”: “This notebook includes the following information on the above referenced subject: Tab 1[:] Staff Briefing Paper on ‘Community Governance’ (previously distributed)[;] Tab 2[:] Summary of Testimony Received at Initial Public Hearings on ‘Community Governance’[;] Tab 3[:] Summary of Testimony Received at Initial Public Hearings on ‘Community Board Input in the Land Use Process’[;] Tab 4[:] ‘Community Governance and [the] Decentralization of Service Delivery’[: draft] Paper [dated 12/2/87] prepared for the Commission by Joseph P. Viteritti and Robert F. Pecorella”<sup>582</sup> (See Document #1)

Folder E1:

1. The Sixth Sense: News From Community Board Six: summer 1988<sup>583</sup>; list of speakers: “Local Voice In Government / Public Hearing”<sup>584</sup>; “The New York City Charter Revision Commission / Hearing On Local Voice In Government / February 28, 1989 / Table Of Exhibits”<sup>585</sup> (See Binder E2)

Binder E2 (Title from original cover: “Public Hearing / Local Voice In Government // February 28, 1989”; handwritten: “Trager”; contents transcribed from document #585):

Frontispiece - Map of Community Districts in New York City with Summary Description of Community Board Functions

1. Explanatory Statement on Local Voice
2. Population Per Community Board in 1970, 1980 and 1985

3. Charts indicating relationships of Council districts to Community Boards (separated by blue sheets of paper)
  - A. Community Boards Contained in Councilmember Districts
  - B. Councilmembers Representing Community Boards
4. Chart of Community Participation in the Budget Process
5. Charts of Empirical Studies of Community Board Budget Requests (separated by blue sheets of paper)
  - A. Community Board Budget Requests and Recommendations for Funding - FY 1988, 1989, and 1990 for Expense and Capital
  - B. Number of Previously Funded Capital Projects Assigned a "Top 10" Priority in Order to Reiterate Community Support - Borough Summary and by Community Board
  - C. Number of Ranked Budget Priorities as Listed in the Preliminary Community District Registers, By Community Board, FY 1988-90
6. Map of Queens Community District 5 with Demographic Information
7. Statement of Community District Needs - Queens Community District 5 (CD 5) - FY 1989
8. Budget Priorities Documents for Queens Community Board 5 (separated by blue sheets of paper)
  - A. Press Release Announcing Public Hearing to Set Budget Priorities
  - B. Memo to Board Members from District Manager about Expense Budget Ballot to Set Priorities
  - C. Expense Budget Ballot to Set Priorities
  - D. Capital Budget Ballot to Set Priorities
  - E. Memo to Executive Board Members from District Manager with Tally of Board Members' Priorities
  - F. Community Board Service Program Priorities Sheet Submitted to OMB
9. FY 89 Departmental Estimates - Geographic Reports for Expense Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
10. Register for the Preliminary Expense Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
11. Geographic Report - Fiscal Year 1989 Capital Budget Departmental Estimates (relevant to Queens CD 5)
12. Register for the Preliminary Capital Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
13. FY 89 Executive Budget - Geographic Reports for Expense Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
14. Register for the Executive Expense Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
15. Geographic report for the Fiscal Year 1989 Executive Capital Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
16. Register for the Executive Capital Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
17. Geographic Report for FY 89 Executive Capital Budget Project Details (CAPIS) - 5/16/88 (relevant to Queens CD 5)
18. FY 89 Geographic Reports for the Adopted Expense Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
19. Register for the Adopted Expense Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
20. FY 89 Adopted Budget - Geographic Report for Capital Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
21. Register for the Adopted Capital Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
22. Geographic Report for FY 89 Capital Commitment Plan Project Details (CAPIS) - 9/16/88 (relevant to Queens CD 5)
23. Geographic Reports - FY 88 Year-End Financial Statement and FY 1989 Current Modified Expense Budget (relevant to Queens CD 5)
24. Geographic Report for FY 89 Capital Commitment Plan Project Details (CAPIS) - 1/29/89 (relevant to Queens CD 5)

25. District Resource statements - Department of Sanitation and Department for Aging (relevant to Queens CB 5)
26. Meeting Notices and Agenda - Queens Community Board 5
27. Board Minutes - Queens Community Board 5
28. Delivery of Local Services Graphic: City Government in the Community
29. Map of Community District 6 with Demographic Information and District Needs Statement
30. District Resource Statements - Department of Sanitation and Department for Aging (relevant to Brooklyn CD 6)
31. Complaint Forms
32. District Service Cabinet Meeting Announcements and Minutes – Brooklyn CD 6
33. General Board Meeting Agenda and Minutes - Brooklyn CD 6
34. Graphic of the ULURP Process
35. Map of Bronx Community District 3 with Demographic Information
36. Executive Committee Minutes - Bronx Community Board 3
37. ULURP Documents - Bronx CD 3 (separated by blue sheets of paper)
  - A. Department of City Planning Notification of the Beginning of the ULURP Process with Accompanying Documents
  - B. Community/Borough Board Recommendations to the Department of City Planning
  - C. Department of City Planning Resolution on the Disposition of City-Owned Property
38. Non-ULURP Case Study/Time Line<sup>586</sup>

Folder E2:

1. "Local Voice In Government / Glossary"<sup>587</sup>;
2. "Community Board Six - Brooklyn / District Service Cabinet": list of "Regular Attendees" and "Infrequent Or Inconsistent Attendees" by agency or office name<sup>588</sup>;
3. Cover memorandum dated 5/9/89 from Frank J. Mauro to NYCCRC members re: "Material on Local Voice"<sup>589</sup>;
4. "Summary Of Proposals By 1988 Charter Revision Commission Chair, Citizens For Charter Change, And Elected Officials / Structure And Powers Of Community And Borough Boards"<sup>590</sup>;
5. "Summary Of Proposals By Community Boards / Structure And Powers Of Community And Borough Boards"<sup>591</sup>;
6. "Summary of Major Ideas From Hearing on Local Voice / February 28, 1989"<sup>592</sup>

**SUB-GROUP F: LAND USE (1989)**

Binder F (Title from original cover: "Public Hearing / Land Use Decision Making // March 2, 1989"; handwritten, "David Trager"):

1. List of speakers: "New York City Charter Revision Commission / March 2, 1989 Hearing" (n.b. hand annotations)
2. (Missing)
3. Chart: "Uniform Land Use Review Procedures -- Section 197c, New York City Charter"
4. "Summary Of Union Square Park / Case Study"
  - 4a. Map: "Union Square Park Special District"
  - 4b. "Exhibit B / Chronology Of Approval Process / Union Square Rezoning And Zeckendorf Special Permits"
  - 4c. Public Hearing Nos. 13 through 19 of the City Planning Commission (?), 1/10/85, related to Union Square Park Special District rezoning and other matters

- 4d. Letters, resolutions, reports, proposals, and other documents of Community Board Nos. 2, 5, and 6 related to Union Square Park Special District rezoning, 1984
- 4e. Resolution Cal. No. 19 of the Board of Estimate, 1/10/85, in which Union Square Park Special District rezoning plan is adopted
- 4f. City of New York Zoning Resolution: Article XI: Special Purpose Districts: Chapter 8: Special Union Square District (1985)
5. "Land Planning And Land Management: Glossary"
6. Tables describing land use regulation procedures in New York City
7. "The City Of New York / Office Of The Mayor / New York, N.Y. 10007 / Executive Order No. 91 / August 24, 1977 / City Environmental Quality Review"<sup>593</sup>

Folder F1:

1. C over letter dated 3/3/89 from Manhattan Community Board 2 Chairpersons Sherri Donovan and Rosemary McGrath to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch and Commissioners<sup>594</sup>; "Draft // Community Board #2, Manhattan / Charter Review Committee // Part I: Land Use // Preliminary Draft - November And December 1987 / Chairperson: Leslie Lowe // Final Draft - January 1988 / Chairperson: Sherri Donovan"<sup>595</sup>

Folder F2:

1. Cover memorandum dated 5/19/89 from "Land Use Staff, Charter Revision Commission" to NYCCRC members re: "Materials requested at Commission Meeting on May 13"<sup>596</sup>:
  - a. "1. 'The Role of Amenities in the Land Use Process,' by The Special Committee on the Role of Amenities in the Land Use Process of the Association of the Bar of the City of New York"<sup>597</sup> (for original reprint, see document #280);
  - b. "2. [cover note to David (G. Trager) re: "Hardship"<sup>598</sup>]; The Landmarks Preservation and Historic Districts Law, Title 25, Chapter 3 of the New York City Administrative Code"<sup>599</sup> (n.b. hand annotations);
  - c. "3. 'New York: The Historic City,' by the Historic City Committee (a/k/a the 'Conklin Commission') of The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission"<sup>600</sup> (for first copy, see document #186);
  - d. "4. Report of May 1986 of the Mayor's Landmarks Committee (a/k/a the 'Cooper Commission')"<sup>601</sup>;
  - e. "5. Letter dated 5/16/89 from Landmarks Preservation Commission Chairman David F.M. Todd to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: "Charter Revision-related changes to the Landmarks Law being discussed" with attached letter dated 3/22/88 from The New York Historic City Committee Chairman William J. Conklin and Members of the Committee to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: recommendations on future of Landmarks Preservation Commission<sup>602</sup> (see documents #184 and 612-613);
  - f. "6. Cover note dated 5/17/89; list dated 5/8/89 of members of the Landmarks Preservation Commission; "Designation Activity Of The Landmarks Preservation Commission"; table dated 5/17/89: "Denials/ Modifications of LPC Designations By the Board of Estimate During The Last 15 Years"; letter dated 5/1/89 from Landmarks Preservation Commission Chairman David F.M. Todd to Mayor Koch re: recommendations of the Conklin Commission report, New York, The Historic City, with attachments<sup>603</sup>

Folder F3:

1. Original, signed letter dated 5/26/89 from Dorothy Rifas to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>604</sup>
2. Original, signed letter dated 5/26/89 from Peter(?) Schiff to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>605</sup>
3. Original, signed letter dated 5/26/89 from Grant Wilfley to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>606</sup>
4. Letter dated 5/30/89 from the Metropolitan Historic Structures Association to NYCCRC Members re: proposed changes to landmarks law, with attached resolutions<sup>607</sup>
5. Cover note on business card from Friends of Terra Cotta President Susan Tunick to David G. Trager<sup>608</sup>; original, signed letter dated 5/31/89 from Tunick to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>609</sup>
6. "Testimony delivered before the New York City Charter Revision Commission public hearing, Wednesday, May 31, 1989" by Preservation League of Staten Island President Mitchell Grubler<sup>610</sup>
7. Original, signed letter dated 6/1/89 from Outreach Project President Father Coleman Costello to David G. Trager re: role of borough presidents in land use and budget process<sup>611</sup>
8. Original, signed letter dated 6/2/89 from The New York Historic City Committee Chairman William J. Conklin to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>612</sup>, with attached letter dated 3/22/88 from Conklin and Members of the Committee to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: recommendations on future of Landmarks Preservation Commission<sup>613</sup> (See documents #184 and 602)
9. Original, signed letter dated 6/2/89 from Friends of Cast Iron President Margot Gayle to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>614</sup>
10. Original, signed letter dated 6/4/89 from Linda C. Jones to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>615</sup>
11. Original, signed letter dated 6/5/89 from Save the Theatres Acting Executive Director Curtis R. Hagedorn to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>616</sup>
12. Original, signed letter dated 6/5/89 from Art Deco Society of New York President David Gibson to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law, with original envelope attached<sup>617</sup>
13. Original, signed letter dated 6/5/89 from Elise M. Quasebarth to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>618</sup>
14. "Statement By [Friends of the Upper East Side Historic Districts President] Halina Rosenthal Before The Charter Revision Commission To Be Delivered On June 6, 1989"<sup>619</sup>; "Local Laws of the City of New York: Governing the establishment and regulation of landmarks, landmark sites, interior landmarks, scenic landmarks and historic districts"<sup>620</sup>; Friends of the Upper East Side Historic Districts bookmark<sup>621</sup> (2 copies)
15. Letter dated 6/6/89 from The Greenwich Village Society for Historic Preservation Executive Director Regina M. Kellerman to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>622</sup>
16. Original, signed letter dated 6/6/89 from Thomas E. Spath of Davis, Hoxie, Faithfull & Hapgood to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>623</sup>
17. Letter dated 6/6/89 from King Manor Executive Director Mary Anne Mrozinski to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law, with original envelope attached<sup>624</sup>
18. Letter dated 6/7/89 from The Committee for the Washington Market Historic District of the Tribeca Community Association Chair Hal Bromm to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>625</sup>

19. Original, signed letter dated 6/7/89 from Damiano G. Maruca to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>626</sup>
20. Original, signed letter dated 6/8/89 from Fraunces Tavern Museum Director William S. Ayres to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>627</sup>
21. Original, signed letter dated 6/9/89 from John M. Forelle of Simpson, Thacher & Bartlett to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>628</sup>
22. Letter dated 6/14/89 from Henry M. Hume to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>629</sup>
23. Letter dated 6/14/[89] from Benjia Morgenstern to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>630</sup>
24. Memorandum dated 6/15/89 from NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. to NYCCRC members re: "Land Use Proposals"<sup>631</sup>

Folder F4:

1. Memorandum dated 6/16/89 from City Planning Commission Chairperson Sylvia Deutsch to Eric Lane re: "Borough Certification Proposal"<sup>632</sup>
2. Chart: "Proposed Land Use Review Procedure"<sup>633</sup>
3. Letter dated 6/16/89 from Suzanne Granfield to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law (n.b. inscription to David G. Trager)<sup>634</sup>
4. Letter dated 6/18/89 from Robert Stone to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>635</sup>
5. Original, signed letter dated 6/19/89 from William E. Hegarty, John J. Kerr, Jr., and David W. Sussman of The Municipal Art Society of New York to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>636</sup>
6. Original, signed letter dated 6/19/89 from Kidder, Peabody & Co. Executive Managing Director Edward A. Cerullo to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>637</sup>
7. Letter dated 6/19/89 from Dawn M. DuBois to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law (n.b. inscription to David G. Trager)<sup>638</sup>
8. Letter dated 6/19/89 from Mr. and Mrs. Harold Scher to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>639</sup>
9. Letter dated 6/19/89 from Florence Sillen to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>640</sup>
10. Letter dated 6/19/89 from Richard W. Hulbert of Cleary, Gottlieb, Steen & Hamilton to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>641</sup>
11. Letter from Dean Bernice Braid of Long Island University to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>642</sup>
12. Cover memorandum dated 6/20/89 from Gene Russianoff (New York Public Interest Research Group) and Marla Simpson (New York Lawyers for the Public Interest) re: "Observations on Charter Revision Commission's Land-Use Proposals"<sup>643</sup>; "Points On Charter Land-Use Proposal" dated 6/20/89 (n.b. handwritten notes on verso of last page)<sup>644</sup>
13. Original, signed letter dated 6/20/89 from Rev. Thomas F. Pike, Rabbi Irving J. Block, Rev. David Garcia, Dr. F. Forrester Church, Rev. William Persell, and Rev. Kenneth Cumberbatch of Calvary Holy Communion and St. George's to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>645</sup>
14. Letter dated 6/20/89 from Deborah Cutler to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>646</sup>

15. Original, signed letter dated 6/22/89 from Scott Opis to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>647</sup>
16. Memorandum dated 6/22/89 from City Planning Commission Chairperson Sylvia Deutsch to NYCCRC members re: "City Council Modifications to Land Use Proposals"<sup>648</sup>
17. Cover note from Linda (Gibbs) to David G. Trager re: "'hardship' in relation to landmarks preservation"<sup>649</sup>; New York Administrative Code §§ 25-301 through 25-321, "Chapter 3: Landmarks Preservation and Historic Districts"<sup>650</sup>; Charter of the City of New York Chapter 21, § 534: "Landmarks Preservation Commission"<sup>651</sup>
18. Cover note (dating from 6/27/89 or later) to David (G. Trager) re: "Hardship"<sup>652</sup>, "Memorandum of law [dated 1/28/87] of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of New York and the Roman Catholic Diocese of Brooklyn as *amici curiae* in support of plaintiff's motion for partial summary judgment" in The Rector, Wardens, and Members of the Vestry of St. Bartholomew's Church v. The City of New York and the Landmarks Preservation Commission of the City of New York, 86 Civ. 2848 (JES)<sup>653</sup>

Folder F5:

1. Original, signed cover letter dated 6/28/89 from Civitas President Genie Rice to David G. Trager<sup>654</sup>; "Recommendations of the Civitas Board on the Land Use Section of the New York City Charter Revision Proposal"<sup>655</sup>
2. Original, signed cover letter dated 7/10/89 from George J. McCormack of Cusack & Stiles to David G. Trager;<sup>656</sup> memorandum dated 7/10/89 from The Interfaith Commission to Study the Landmarking of Religious Property to NYCCRC re: "Reform in the Landmarking of Churches and Syn[a]gogues Is a Vital and Appropriate Element of Charter Revision"<sup>657</sup>
3. Letter dated 7/10/89 from Rev. Karl W. Gillmeister and Ron Wilkoc of The Church of the Covenant to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>658</sup>
4. Original, signed letter dated 7/11/89 from Elizabeth O'Brien to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>659</sup>
5. Letter dated 7/13/89 from the Udalls Cove Preservation Committee Founder Aurora Gareiss to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to process governing land use, etc.<sup>660</sup>
6. Original, signed letter dated 7/17/89 from Rabbi Stanley M. Davids of Central Synagogue to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>661</sup>
7. Original, signed cover memorandum dated 7/18/89 from George J. McCormack of Cusack & Stiles to NYCCRC<sup>662</sup>; "Statement of Rev. Msgr. Joseph P. Murphy to the New York Charter Revision Commission at Its Staten Island Meeting on July 17, 1989"<sup>663</sup>; "Statement of Rev. Msgr. Timothy A. McDonnell to the New York Charter Revision Commission at Its Manhattan Public Meeting on July 18, 1989"<sup>664</sup>
8. Cover memorandum dated 7/18/89 from Edythe W. First and Annette Y. Rosen of the Women's City Club of New York to NYCCRC<sup>665</sup>; letter dated 7/17/89 from First and Rosen to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>666</sup>
9. "Testimony of Community Board 5-Q Special Committee on Charter Revision - July 19, 1989 - LaGuardia Community College, L.I. City, New York"<sup>667</sup>
10. Letter dated 7/19/89 from the Metropolitan Historic Structures Association to NYCCRC Members re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>668</sup>
11. Original, signed letter dated 7/19/89 from Fraunces Tavern Museum Director William S. Ayres to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>669</sup>



12. Original, signed letter dated 7/19/89 from Jamie Gibbs and Associates Principal Jamie Gibbs to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law; "Jamie Gibbs' - Biographical Information"<sup>670</sup>
13. Memorandum dated 7/21/89 from The Interfaith Commission to Study the Landmarking of Religious Property to NYCCRC re: "Two Recent United States Supreme Court Decisions Bearing on Landmarking by Municipalities"<sup>671</sup>
14. Letter dated 7/21/89 from The Committee to Oppose the Sale of St. Bartholomew's Church Chairman and President J. Sinclair Armstrong to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. and NYCCRC members re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>672</sup>
15. "Statement by the Brooklyn Heights Association Before the Charter Revision Commission on the Subject of Land Use Decisions" dated 7/21/89<sup>673</sup>
16. Letter dated 7/24/89 from Rev. John C. Fisher of The Church of the Epiphany to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>674</sup>
17. Memorandum dated 7/28/89 from Marla G. Simpson of New York Lawyers for the Public Interest to NYCCRC members re: "dispositions of City-owned residential properties" with fax cover sheet (from Simpson to David G. Trager)<sup>675</sup>
18. Cover memorandum dated 7/28/89 from The New York Landmarks Conservancy to NYCCRC members; photocopied clipping: Rev. Thomas F. Pike, "Building Blocks", Newsday, 7/28/89<sup>676</sup>
19. Original, signed letter dated 7/28/89 from The Romanesque Revival Society President David M. Hollister to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>677</sup>
20. Original, signed letter dated 7/28/89 from Save the Theatres Acting Executive Director Curtis R. Hagedorn to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>678</sup>
21. Letter dated 7/28/89 from Francine Weinberg et al. to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>679</sup>
22. Original, signed letter dated 7/31/89 from Architectural Record Senior Editor Charles K. Hoyt to David G. Trager re: proposed changes to landmarks law<sup>680</sup>

#### **SUB-GROUP G: ETHICS (1985-1989)**

##### Folder G1:

1. Draft Stipulation of Settlement dated 6/85 in Lorraine Cullen, et al. v. Joseph M. Margiotta, et al., 76 Civ. 2247 (E.D.N.Y.)<sup>681</sup>
2. State of New York Commission of Investigation: An Investigation of The New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission: Findings and Recommendations, 12/86<sup>682</sup>
3. "A Proposal For Revising Chapter 68 ('Ethics') / Of The New York City Charter // For Discussion At A Public Meeting / Of The / New York City Charter Revision Commission // December 8, 1987" (n.b. hand annotations)<sup>683</sup>
4. "Draft Proposal on Ethics" dated 12/8/87 (n.b. hand annotations)<sup>684</sup>
5. Cover memorandum dated 12/10/87 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members<sup>685</sup>; memorandum dated 12/9/87 from Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: "Ethics Proposal"<sup>686</sup>
6. Cover memorandum dated 12/11/87 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members<sup>687</sup>; "To Whom Does the Government Lawyer Owe the Duty of Loyalty When Clients Are in Conflict?," reprinted from 29 Howard Law Journal 4 (1986)<sup>688</sup>
7. Original, signed letter dated 12/14/87 from Citizens for Charter Change Ethics Committee Co-Chair Gene Russianoff to David G. Trager re: "views on the ethics proposals now being considered by the Charter Revision Commission" with attached "Comparison of Proposals of Charter Revision"

Chairman on Revising Chapter 68 (Ethics) with Proposals of Ethics Sub-Committee of Citizens for Charter Change”<sup>689</sup>

8. Original, signed cover letter dated 12/16/87 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to David G. Trager<sup>690</sup>; draft Charter: Chapter 68 (“Ethics”; n.b. hand annotations)<sup>691</sup>
9. Memorandum dated 12/17/87 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: “Summary of Proposal for Revision of Chapter 68 (‘Ethics’) of The New York City Charter”<sup>692</sup>
10. Cover letter dated 2/29/88 from S. Stanley Kreutzer of The Jacob D. Fuchsberg Law Firm to New York City Council Member Joseph M. Fitzpatrick<sup>693</sup>; “Memorandum of S. Stanley Kreutzer, Concerning the Applicability of the Council [sic] of Ethics to Members of the City Council”<sup>694</sup>

Folder G2:

1. Paper presented at National Institute of Municipal Law Officers’ 1988 Mid-Year Seminar, Washington, D.C., 3/15/88: “Government Lawyers’ Conflicts in Representing Public Pension Funds and Remedies for Breach of Duty of Loyalty” by William Josephson<sup>695</sup>
2. Memorandum dated 4/21/88 from NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch to NYCCRC members re: “Options on the Composition and Jurisdiction of the Board of Ethics”<sup>696</sup>
3. Cover memorandum dated 4/29/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: “Materials on Ethics” in preparation 5/9/88 public meeting<sup>697</sup> (n.b. enclosures missing)
4. Cover memorandum dated 5/2/88 from State of New York Commission on Government Integrity Chairman John D. Feerick<sup>698</sup>; State of New York Commission on Government Integrity, Ethics in Government Act: Report and Recommendations, 4/6/88<sup>699</sup>
5. Letter dated 5/27/88 from Citizens Union of the City of New York to NYCCRC members re: creation of “a more powerful and independent Board of Ethics”<sup>700</sup>
6. Cover note dated 6/13/88 from Brooklyn Community Board 14 Charter Revision Committee Chair Alvin M. Berk to David G. Trager<sup>701</sup>; letter dated 6/10/88 from Berk and Helen D. Henkin to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: “express right to independent counsel by certain City officials and entities”<sup>702</sup>
7. Cover memorandum dated 7/21/88 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members<sup>703</sup>; “City Council Response To / Charter Revision Commission Proposals // July 19, 1988”: “City Administrative Procedure Act” dated 7/18/88; “Conflicts of Interest Boards” dated 7/19/88; “Conflicts of Interest Code” dated 7/19/88; “Advice and Consent over Appointments to the Tax Appeals Tribunal and Executive Conflicts of Interest Board” dated 7/19/88; “Public Campaign Financing” dated 7/19/88; and “Voter Assistance” dated 7/19/88<sup>704</sup>
8. Cover letter dated 7/29/88 from Manhattan Borough President David N. Dinkins to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch; Manhattan Borough Board resolution dated 7/28/88 on “Conflict of Interest for Borough Board and Community Board members”<sup>705</sup>
9. Letter dated 7/6/89 from New York City Campaign Finance Board Chairman Joseph A. O’Hare to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. re: proposed changes to campaign finance law<sup>706</sup>

**SUB-GROUP H: INTERNAL CONTROLS (1988-1989)**

Folder H1:

1. Cover memorandum dated 5/13/88 from Frank J. Mauro to NYCCRC members re: “Materials on Internal Controls”<sup>707</sup>; “Briefing Paper on Internal Control Framework - previously distributed”<sup>708</sup>; “Draft bill, with summary” (2 versions)<sup>709-710</sup>; memorandum dated 5/11/88 from Eileen Sullivan to Frank J. Mauro re: “Recommendations of Committee on Municipal Affairs on DOI” (n.b. hand annotations)<sup>711</sup>; “Paper on the New York City Department of Investigation by the Committee on

Municipal Affairs of the Association of the Bar of the City of New York<sup>712</sup>; American Institute of Certified Public Accountants, “The Auditor’s Study and Evaluation of Internal Control” (11/72), from Codification of Statements on Auditing Standards: Numbers 1 to 23<sup>713</sup>

2. “Internal Controls: Proposal” (2 copies, second stamped “Draft” and “May 18 1988”)<sup>714</sup>
3. Original, signed letter dated 7/19/88 from Eric Lane to David G. Trager re: evidentiary standard for hearings under the City Administrative Procedure Act<sup>715</sup>; memorandum dated 7/12/88 from New York City Law Department Legal Counsel Division Chief Paul T. Rephen to Eric Lane re: “Substantial Evidence”<sup>716</sup>
4. Letter dated 7/19/88 from The Plumbing Foundation City of New York Vice Chairman Leonard X. Farbman to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: public participation in city agency oversight hearings<sup>717</sup>
5. Letter dated 7/25/88 from New York State Comptroller Edward V. Regan to NYCCRC Chairman Richard Ravitch re: “proposed City Charter amendments covering maintenance of the City’s capital plant”<sup>718</sup>
6. Cover letter dated 7/25/88 from New York City Department of General Services Hadley W. Gold to Eric Lane<sup>719</sup>; draft Charter: Chapter 59 (“Department of General Services”)<sup>720</sup>

#### Folder H2:

1. Letter dated 7/26/88 from Helen D. Henkin and Alvin M. Berk of Brooklyn Community Board 14 to Eric Lane re: proposed changes to City Administrative Procedure Act<sup>721</sup> (for second copy, see document #723)
2. Cover note dated 7/27/88 from Brooklyn Community Board 14 Charter Revision Committee Chair Alvin M. Berk to David G. Trager<sup>722</sup>; letter dated 7/26/88 from Helen D. Henkin and Berk to Eric Lane re: proposed changes to City Administrative Procedure Act<sup>723</sup> (for first copy, see document #721); letter dated 5/31/88 from Berk and Henkin to Lane re: proposed changes to City Administrative Procedure Act<sup>724</sup>
3. Cover letter dated 7/27/88 from Gerald C. Tobin of Cusack & Stiles to Eric Lane<sup>725</sup>; memorandum from The New York County Lawyers’ Association Committee on the City of New York, Subcommittee on Charter Revision: “Comments on the Proposed City Administrative Procedure Act”<sup>726</sup>
4. Letter dated 7/29/88 from William W. Buzbee of the Natural Resources Defense Council to the NYCCRC re: availability to public of regulatory agendas of city agencies and mayoral responses thereto under the City Administrative Procedure Act<sup>727</sup>
5. Cover letter dated 8/2/88 from New York Chamber of Commerce and Industry Executive Vice President James P. Gifford to NYCCRC Commissioner Archibald R. Murray<sup>728</sup>; “Statement by James P. Gifford [...] to The New York City Charter Revision Commission on the Subject of New York City Tax Appeals” dated 7/6/88<sup>729</sup>
6. “Internal Controls”: description dated 8/3/88 of NYCCRC proposals<sup>730</sup>
7. Draft Charter: Chapter 45 (“City Administrative Procedure Act”; “8-5-88”)<sup>731</sup>
8. Draft Charter: Section 1110-a (“Capital plant inventory and maintenance”)<sup>732</sup> (see document #100B)
9. Letter dated 4/10/89 from District Council 37 Executive Director Stanley W. Hill to NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz re: “reforms of New York City’s contracting system”<sup>733</sup>
10. Cover memorandum dated 5/8/89 from Frank Mauro to NYCCRC members re: “State Comptroller’s Authority to Approve Contracts”: “Attached for your information are: 1. the provision of state law [7 Finance Law §§ 111-115] requiring the comptroller to approve state contracts; 2. [cover letter dated 4/7 from New York State Comptroller Edward V. Regan to

NYCCRC Chairman Frederick A.O. Schwarz, Jr. and “a memo [dated 3/89] from State Comptroller Ned Regan outlining how the Comptroller’s office executes this responsibility; 3. a memo [dated 12/13/87] from Richard Briffault [to Eric Lane] discussing the state comptroller’s authority under the statute; and 4. relevant case law and opinions of the Attorney General on the subject [Opinions of the Attorney-General, 2/1/15; Belmar Contracting Co. v. State of New York, 233 N.Y. 189 (1922); Opinions of the Attorney-General, 9/12/34; Opinions of the Attorney-General, 1/14/43; Opinions of the Attorney General, 12/21/51; Deverho Construction Co. v. State of New York, 94 Misc.2d 1053 (Court of Claims 1978); Becker v. State of New York, 65 A.D.2d 65 (3d Dept. 1978); Matter of Konski Engineers v. Levitt, 69 A.D.2d 940 (3d Dept. 1979); Flaherty Corp. v. State of New York, 102 Misc.2d 438 (Court of Claims 1979); Matter of Kick v. Regan, 110 A.D.2d 934 (3d Dept. 1985)].”<sup>734</sup>

Folder H3:

1. Cover memorandum dated 5/11/89 from Eric Lane and Frank J. Mauro to NYCCRC members re: “Enclosed Materials” (list transcribed below):
  - 1) Regarding the Comptroller:  
Draft: Selection of the Comptroller and Functions of the Office [dated 10/1/88] by Gerald Benjamin  
November 10, 1987 letter from [New York City Comptroller] Harrison J. Goldin to [NYCCRC Chairman] Richard Ravitch  
May 9, 1989 letter from Assemblyman Alan Hevesi
  - 2) Regarding “off budget” funds:  
New York City Planning Commission Accountability for Cash Contributions [dated 8/15/88] by the Office of the State Comptroller  
[photocopy from reporter:] Anderson v. Regan [53 N.Y.2d 356 (1981)]

Folder H4:

- 3) Regarding impoundment:  
The federal impoundment law [photocopy of 2 USC §§ 681-687]  
Relevant State Finance Law provisions [photocopy of case notes 3-9 on 4 Finance Law § 41, and text of 4 Finance Law § 42]  
[photocopy from reporter: County of] Oneida v. Berle [49 N.Y.2d 515 (1980)], which deals with the governor’s impoundment authority  
An article I have written on this issue [photocopy of Eric Lane, “Legislative Oversight of an Executive Budget Process: Impoundments in New York,” 5 Pace Law Review 211 (1985)]
- 4) Regarding the use of performance information in the budget process:  
Sets of budgets for Corrections Departments (or their equivalents) from the following governments:  
New York City (Executive Budget [for FY 1988] & Mayor’s Management Report [dated 9/87])  
San Mateo County, California [FY 1987-88]  
Westchester County, New York [1989]  
San Diego County, California (Detention Facility Services) [1988-89]  
Santa Clara County, California (Sheriff Custody Operations) [FY 1988]
- 5) May 9, 198[9] letter from the League of Women Voters [President Laura Altschuler to the

Editor of the New York Times]<sup>735</sup>

Folder H5:

1. Original, signed letter dated 6/7/89 from United Way of New York City Executive Vice President Horace W. Morris to David G. Trager re: contracting, with original envelope attached<sup>736</sup>
2. Cover memorandum dated 6/13/89 from Joel N. Copperman, Hadley W. Gold, and William J. Grinker of the Mayor's Office of Contracts to NYCCRC members re: "Contracting - Preliminary Charter Proposals" with attached draft dated 3/31/89 of contracting manual table of contents<sup>737</sup>
3. Draft of 7/10/89 "background memorandum, prepared by staff": "Civilian Complaint Review Board"<sup>738</sup> (n.b. hand annotations; Post-It note on first page: "Chapter 18 / Police Dept."; see documents #740 and 745)

Folder H6:

1. Cover memorandum dated 7/10/89 from David G. Trager to NYCCRC members<sup>739</sup> (for copy, see document #745); draft of 7/10/89 "background memorandum, prepared by staff: "Civilian Complaint Review Board"<sup>740</sup> (see documents #738 and 745; n.b. inscription: "David [G. Trager]: The figures are part of an unreleased study to which we do not have access. Eric [Lane]" and other hand annotations); "Statement by Police Commissioner Benjamin Ward on the Final Report of C.C.R.B. on the Tompkins Square Park Incident" dated 4/18/89, with attached Operations Order No. 72 dated 6/29/89 re: "Issuance of New Department Helmets and Shield Number Decals"<sup>741</sup>
2. Cover memorandum dated 7/11/89 from Eric Lane to NYCCRC members re: "Enclosed Documents"<sup>742</sup>;
3. "1. Recent correspondence received by the Commission up to July 7, 1989" (n.b. missing); "2. Transcripts of public hearing testimony recently received by the Commission" (n.b. missing); "3. Materials related to the upcoming meeting on July 13[:] Memo and tables [from 'Comptroller's Report for Fiscal 1988'] relating to the 5%/50,000 budget modifications"<sup>743</sup>; "Compilation of documents related to prompt payment ['1. Auditor General's Report to the Mayor on Prompt Payment, October 23, 1987.']; '2. Summary of Significant Matters, Comptroller's Audit Report on DGS March 1987 Vendor Payment Report, December 23, 1988.']; '3. NYC Council Intro. Nos. 1195 and 1201 -- prompt payment legislation proposed to the City Council.']; '4. NYS Finance Law, Article XI-A - Interest Payments on Certain Amounts Owed by State.']; '5. Press Release by NY State Comptroller Edward V. Regan, State Pays More Interest Penalties to Vendors, May 25, 1989.']"<sup>744</sup>; "July 10, 1989 memo from Commissioner Trager with staff memo on the Civilian Complaint Review Board"<sup>745</sup> (for original, see document #739; see also documents #738 and 740); "Memo from Frank Mauro on the Exclusion of Operating Expenses from the Capital Budget"<sup>746</sup>
4. Cover letter dated 11/2/89 from Frank J. Mauro to Brooklyn Community Board 14 District Manager Terry Rodie re: "requested estimates of the costs and savings of the proposed revision of the New York City Charter"<sup>747</sup>: 1. "Summary of Fiscal Impact of Revised New York City Charter by Subject"<sup>748</sup>; 2. "Required Costs, Desirable Costs and Savings Related to the Charter Revision Commission Proposals"<sup>749</sup>; 3. "Comparison of Borough President Golden's Estimates of the Fiscal Impact of the Proposed Charter with Those of the CRC Staff"<sup>750</sup>; 4. "Comparison of OMB and CRC Staff Estimates of FY 1990 Fiscal Impact of Proposed Charter Revision"<sup>751</sup>; 5. "Comparison of OMB and CRC Staff Estimates of FY 1991 Fiscal Impact of Proposed Charter Revision"<sup>752</sup>